

**The Attorney-Client
Privilege
and
The Work Product Doctrine:
A PRACTITIONER'S GUIDE**

Third Edition
Second Printing

Thomas E. Spahn
McGuireWoods LLP



 **Virginia CLE**
Publications

THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT
PRIVILEGE
AND
THE WORK PRODUCT
DOCTRINE:
A PRACTITIONER'S GUIDE

Volumes I and II

Third Edition
Second Printing

Thomas E. Spahn
McGuireWoods LLP

 VirginiaCLE[®]
Publications

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

<i>About the Author</i>	iii
<i>Preface</i>	v

CHAPTER 1: ORGANIZATION OF THE BOOK

1.1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.2	ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE.....	1
1.3	CLIENTS.....	1
1.4	LAWYERS.....	3
1.5	CONTENT OF COMMUNICATIONS	3
1.6	CONTEXT OF COMMUNICATIONS.....	6
1.7	PRIVILEGE FOR INTERNAL CORPORATE INVESTIGATIONS.....	8
1.8	WAIVER OF THE PRIVILEGE	9
1.9	WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION.....	12
1.10	PROTECTED CONTENT	15
1.11	PROTECTION FOR INTERNAL CORPORATE INVESTIGATIONS	16
1.12	OVERCOMING WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION	17
1.13	WAIVER OF WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION	18
1.14	LITIGATION OVERVIEW.....	20
1.15	SOURCE AND CHOICE OF LAW	20
1.16	ASSERTING THE PROTECTIONS.....	21
1.17	LITIGATING THE PROTECTIONS.....	22

CHAPTER 2: ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE: INTRODUCTION AND BASIC PRINCIPLES

2.1	INTRODUCTION	25
2.2	ETHICS DUTY OF CONFIDENTIALITY CONTRASTED	25

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.3	SOCIETAL BENEFITS AND COSTS OF THE PRIVILEGE	27
2.301	Introduction	27
2.302	Genesis	27
2.303	Societal Benefits of the Privilege.....	28
2.304	Societal Costs of the Privilege	29
2.305	Tension Between Competing Societal Interests.....	30
2.306	Benefits of Certainty	30
2.4	THE PRIVILEGE'S ABSOLUTE PROTECTION	31
2.401	Introduction	31
2.402	Majority Approach: Absolute Protection.....	31
2.403	Protection Extends to Disclosure	32
2.404	Aberrational Decisions.....	33
2.5	CLIENTS' AND LAWYERS' INABILITY TO CREATE OR DISCLAIM PRIVILEGE PROTECTION	34
2.501	Introduction	34
2.502	Subjective Belief Not Controlling.....	34
2.503	Parties' Agreement Not Controlling.....	35
2.504	Parties' Disclaimer of Privilege Not Controlling.....	36
2.6	CONSENSUS FORMULATION.....	37
2.7	KEY ELEMENTS OF THE PRIVILEGE.....	38
2.8	TYPES OF PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS	38
2.9	CURRENT TRENDS AND THE FUTURE	38
CHAPTER 3: CLIENTS: INTRODUCTION AND BASIC PRINCIPLES		
3.1	INTRODUCTION.....	41
3.2	EXISTENCE OF AN ATTORNEY-CLIENT RELATIONSHIP.....	41
3.3	CLIENT'S ACTIONS AND UNCOMMUNICATED STATEMENTS.....	41
3.4	CLIENT'S OWNERSHIP OF THE PRIVILEGE.....	42
CHAPTER 4: MISCELLANEOUS CLIENTS		
4.1	INTRODUCTION	43
4.2	PROSPECTIVE CLIENTS.....	43
4.201	Introduction	43
4.202	Majority Rule	43
4.203	Unsolicited Electronic Communications	44
4.3	INDIVIDUAL CLIENTS.....	44
4.301	Introduction	44
4.302	Duration of the Privilege	44

TABLE OF CONTENTS

4.303	Successors to Individual Clients	45
4.304	Deceased Clients	45
4.305	Clients' Agents.....	45
4.4	GOVERNMENT ENTITIES AS CLIENTS.....	45
4.401	Introduction	45
4.402	Special Privilege Rules.....	46
4.403	Separate Representation of Government Employees	48
4.404	Power to Waive the Government's Privilege	49
4.405	Freedom of Information Act.....	49
4.5	NON-CORPORATE INSTITUTIONAL CLIENTS	49
CHAPTER 5: JOINT CLIENTS		
5.1	INTRODUCTION	51
5.2	NUMBER OF JOINTLY REPRESENTED CLIENTS.....	52
5.3	EXISTENCE OF A JOINT REPRESENTATION	52
5.301	Introduction	52
5.302	Establishing a Joint Representation.....	52
5.303	Client Disputes Joint Representation.....	54
5.304	Third Party Disputes Joint Representation	55
5.4	EFFECT OF A JOINT REPRESENTATION: ETHICS RULES	58
5.401	Introduction	58
5.402	Loyalty Issues	59
5.403	Information Flow Issues	59
5.5	EFFECT OF A JOINT REPRESENTATION: PRIVILEGE PRINCIPLES....	62
5.501	Introduction	62
5.502	Communications with the Joint Lawyer.....	63
5.503	Client-to-Client Communications	63
5.504	Joint Clients' Right to Access Joint Lawyer's Files	64
5.6	WAIVER IN JOINT REPRESENTATIONS	64
5.7	ADVERSITY AMONG JOINTLY REPRESENTED CLIENTS.....	64
5.8	COMPARISON TO COMMON INTEREST AGREEMENTS.....	64
5.801	Introduction	64
5.802	Advantages and Disadvantages of a Joint Representation	64
5.803	Advantages and Disadvantages of a Common Interest Agreement.....	65
CHAPTER 6: CORPORATE CLIENTS		
6.1	INTRODUCTION	69
6.101	Organization of Chapter 6	69

TABLE OF CONTENTS

6.102	General Rules for Corporate Clients	70
6.103	Court Scrutiny of Corporation's Privilege Claim	70
6.2	DEFINING THE "CLIENT" WITHIN A CORPORATE ENTITY	71
6.201	Introduction	71
6.202	Relationship with a Component of the Corporate Entity	71
6.203	Relationship with the Corporate Entity's Owners	73
6.3	COMMUNICATIONS WITHIN A CORPORATE FAMILY	75
6.301	Introduction	75
6.302	Broad View of Privilege Protection	76
6.303	Narrow View of Privilege Protection	78
6.304	Maximizing Privilege Protection	80
6.4	EFFECT OF CORPORATE STOCK TRANSACTIONS	81
6.401	Introduction	81
6.402	Joint Representation Issues	82
6.403	Other Controlling Rules or Law	82
6.5	EFFECT OF CORPORATE ASSET TRANSACTIONS	82
6.501	Introduction	82
6.502	"Bright-Line" Test	83
6.503	The "Practical Consequences" Test	83
6.6	REPRESENTATION OF CORPORATE AFFILIATES IN THE TRANSACTION	85
6.601	Introduction	85
6.602	Existence and Effect of a Joint Representation	85
6.7	AGREEMENTS ALTERING THE PRIVILEGE'S OWNERSHIP	90
6.701	Introduction	90
6.702	Possible Ways to Affect the Privilege's Ownership	90
6.703	Other Judicial Suggestions	92
6.704	Waiver Implications	95
6.705	Uncertainty Affecting the Privilege's Ownership	95
6.8	BANKRUPT AND DEFUNCT CORPORATIONS	95
6.801	Introduction	95
6.802	Bankrupt Corporations	95
6.803	Defunct Corporations	97
6.804	Disbanded Bankruptcy Committees	98
6.9	SEPARATE AND JOINT REPRESENTATIONS OF EMPLOYEES	98
6.901	Introduction	98
6.902	Analyzing Privilege Protection for Employee Communications	99
6.903	Intentional Separate Representations in Non-Corporate Matters	99
6.904	Intentional Separate Representations in Corporate Matters	99
6.905	Accidental Separate Representations on Corporate Matters	101
6.906	Intentional Joint Representations on Corporate Matters	102

TABLE OF CONTENTS

6.907	Accidental Joint Representations on Corporate Matters	103
6.908	Evaluating Possible Representation of Corporate Employees	105
6.10	UPJOHN STANDARD FOR COMMUNICATIONS	107
6.1001	Introduction	107
6.1002	“Control Group” Standard	107
6.1003	<i>Upjohn</i> Standard	109
6.1004	Applying the <i>Upjohn</i> Standard	112
6.1005	Effect of an Employee’s Personal Lawyer’s Presence	115
6.1006	Employee Communications Without a Lawyer’s Involvement.....	115
6.1007	Privilege Implications of Widespread Intracorporate Circulation..	115
6.1008	Employees’ Personal Communications on Employer’s Computers .	116
6.1009	Communications with Adverse Corporation’s Employees	116
6.11	“NEED TO KNOW” STANDARD FOR COMMUNICATIONS	116
6.1101	Introduction	116
6.1102	Relevance of “Need to Know” Standard	117
6.1103	Relationship to the <i>Upjohn</i> Standard	117
6.1104	Relationship to the “Control Group” Standard	118
6.1105	Defining the “Need to Know” Standard	119
6.1106	Evidentiary Support for the “Need to Know” Standard.....	123
6.1107	Work Product Doctrine	125
6.1108	Conclusion.....	126
6.12	COMMUNICATIONS WITH FORMER EMPLOYEES.....	126
6.1201	Introduction	126
6.1202	Majority View (the <i>Peralta</i> Standard)	126
6.1203	Possible Joint Representation with a Former Employee.....	128
6.1204	Presence of Former Employee’s Personal Lawyer	129
6.1205	Availability of Work Product Protection.....	129
6.1206	Ex Parte Communications with Adversary’s Former Employees...	129
6.1207	Former Employee’s Rights to Privileged Documents.....	129
6.1208	Waiver Issues	131
6.13	COMMUNICATIONS WITH INDEPENDENT CONTRACTORS.....	131
6.1301	Introduction	131
6.1302	Applying the “Functional Equivalent” Doctrine.....	132
6.1303	Examples of Communications Protected with Contractors	133
6.1304	Examples of Communications Not Protected with Contractors.....	136
6.14	COMMUNICATIONS WITH AGENTS/CONSULTANTS.....	138
6.15	SHAREHOLDERS’ RIGHT TO PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS.....	139
CHAPTER 7: THE “FIDUCIARY EXCEPTION”		
7.1	INTRODUCTION	141
7.2	HISTORIC TRUST PRINCIPLE.....	141

TABLE OF CONTENTS

7.3	SHAREHOLDERS' RIGHT TO PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS	142
7.301	Introduction	142
7.302	Shareholders as "Clients" in Derivative Lawsuits.....	142
7.303	Courts Rejecting the <i>Garner</i> Doctrine	143
7.304	The "Good Cause" Requirement	144
7.305	Plaintiffs' Status as Shareholders.....	144
7.306	Shareholders' Right to Revisit Their Request	144
7.307	Application to Work Product	144
7.308	Expansion of the <i>Garner</i> Doctrine.....	145
7.4	NAMING THE EXPANDED DOCTRINE	146
7.5	COURTS' CONTINUING DEBATE ABOUT APPLICABILITY.....	147
7.6	ABSENCE OF "GOOD CAUSE" REQUIREMENT	147
7.7	EXAMPLES TO WHICH EXCEPTION APPLIES.....	148
7.8	EXAMPLES TO WHICH EXCEPTION DOES NOT APPLY.....	149
7.9	LIMITATION TO FIDUCIARY FUNCTIONS	150
7.10	"SETTLOR EXCEPTION"	151
7.11	"LIABILITY EXCEPTION".....	152
7.12	OTHER FIDUCIARY EXCEPTION ISSUES.....	154
7.13	APPLICATION TO LAW FIRMS.....	155
CHAPTER 8: CLIENT AGENTS/CONSULTANTS		
8.1	INTRODUCTION	159
8.2	CHARACTERIZATION OF CLIENT AGENTS	159
8.3	CLIENT AGENTS NECESSARY TO TRANSMIT COMMUNICATIONS.....	160
8.4	DEFINING THE LEVEL OF NECESSITY	161
8.5	CLIENT AGENTS WITHIN PRIVILEGE PROTECTION	164
8.6	CLIENT AGENTS OUTSIDE PRIVILEGE PROTECTION.....	167
8.7	IMPORTANCE OF A CHOICE OF LAW ANALYSIS	172
8.8	"FUNCTIONAL EQUIVALENT" DOCTRINE	173
8.9	CHANGE IN AGENTS' ROLES	173
8.10	CLIENT AGENTS VERSUS LAWYER AGENTS.....	174

TABLE OF CONTENTS

8.11	APPLICATION OF THE WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE	174
8.12	IMPORTANCE OF EDUCATING CLIENTS	175
CHAPTER 9: LAWYERS		
9.1	INTRODUCTION	177
9.2	NONLAWYERS	177
9.3	PATENT AGENTS	178
9.4	NONLAWYERS THOUGHT BY CLIENTS TO BE LAWYERS	178
9.5	LAWYERS NOT ABLE TO PRACTICE LAW	181
9.6	MULTIJURISDICTIONAL PRACTICE ISSUES	182
9.7	IN-HOUSE LAWYERS	183
9.701	Introduction	183
9.702	In-House Lawyers Representing Corporate Families	184
9.703	In-House Lawyers for Law Firms	184
9.704	In-House Lawyers Licensed in Other Jurisdictions	184
9.705	Special Scrutiny for In-House Lawyers' Communications	184
9.706	Judicial Reaction to In-House Lawyers' Privilege Claims	184
9.707	In-House Lawyers Pursuing Wrongful Termination Actions	185
9.8	FOREIGN NONLAWYERS	185
9.9	FOREIGN LAWYERS	187
9.901	Foreign Outside Lawyers	187
9.902	Foreign In-House Lawyers and Third Parties	187
9.903	Foreign In-House Lawyers and Their Clients/Employers	188
9.904	Effect of Choice of Law Issues	188
9.10	WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE CONTRASTED	189
CHAPTER 10: LAWYER AGENTS/CONSULTANTS		
10.1	INTRODUCTION	191
10.2	PRIVILEGE PROTECTION FOR LAWYER AGENTS	191
10.3	COMPARISON TO CLIENT AGENTS	192
10.4	LAWYER AGENTS TRANSMITTING PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS	192
10.5	OTHER LAWYER AGENTS	193
10.6	SCOPE OF AVAILABLE PROTECTION	195

TABLE OF CONTENTS

10.7	PROTECTED LAWYER AGENTS VERSUS UNPROTECTED CLIENT AGENTS	195
10.8	NONDISPOSITIVE FACTORS	196
10.801	Introduction	196
10.802	Retention of Agent.....	197
10.803	Documentation	199
10.804	Communication Flow	199
10.9	“NEED” FOR THE AGENT’S ASSISTANCE	200
10.10	BEST PRACTICES.....	203
10.11	LAWYER AGENTS INSIDE THE PRIVILEGE.....	203
10.12	LAWYER AGENTS OUTSIDE THE PRIVILEGE.....	208
10.13	“MORPHING” OF A LAWYER AGENT ROLE.....	211
10.14	LAWYER AGENTS PLAYING DUAL ROLES	212
10.15	NON-TESTIFYING EXPERTS	212
10.16	LAWYER AGENT’S ROLE IN WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION	212
CHAPTER 11: UNPROTECTED BACKGROUND INFORMATION		
11.1	INTRODUCTION	213
11.2	COMMUNICATIONS ABOUT BACKGROUND INFORMATION	213
11.3	FACT OF THE REPRESENTATION.....	213
11.301	Introduction	213
11.302	Fact of the Representation.....	214
11.303	Client’s Identity	215
11.304	Other Facts About the Client	216
11.305	Retainer Agreements	217
11.4	GENERAL SUBJECT MATTER OF THE REPRESENTATION	217
11.401	Introduction	217
11.402	Unprotected Information About Lawyer’s Representation	218
11.403	General Versus Specific Facts About the Representation	218
11.404	Subject Matter of the Representation as Lawyer “Acts.”	219
11.405	Effect on Waiver	219
11.406	Relationship to Work Product Doctrine.....	220
11.5	UNPROTECTED FEE INFORMATION	220
11.501	Introduction	220
11.502	Fee Arrangements	220
11.503	Other Fee Information	221
11.504	Expenses	222

TABLE OF CONTENTS

11.6	PROTECTED FEE INFORMATION	223
11.7	LAWYERS' BILLS.....	223
11.701	General Rule.....	223
11.702	Privilege for Portions of Bills.....	224
11.703	Danger of Implied Waiver.....	227
11.704	Work Product Protection.....	228
11.8	BACKGROUND FACTS ABOUT ATTORNEY-CLIENT COMMUNICATIONS.....	228
11.801	Introduction	228
11.802	Circumstances of the Communication	228
11.803	Privilege Protection for the Fact of a Communication.....	230
11.804	Non-Privileged Background Information and the Client's Action	231
11.805	Work Product Protection.....	232
11.9	SUBJECT MATTER OF ATTORNEY-CLIENT COMMUNICATIONS.....	233
11.901	Introduction	233
11.902	General Versus Specific Subject Matter Descriptions	233
 CHAPTER 12: CONTENT AND THE "COMMUNICATION" ELEMENT		
12.1	INTRODUCTION	235
12.2	APPROACH OF THIS BOOK.....	235
12.3	FORMS OF TRANSMISSION AND SUBSTANCE	236
12.301	Introduction	236
12.302	Form of Transmission	237
12.303	New Forms of Electronic Communication	237
12.304	Content.....	238
12.4	CLIENTS' ACTS.....	239
12.401	Introduction	239
12.402	Clients' Acts Conveying Information	239
12.403	Clients' Demeanor	239
12.404	Acts Clients Take After Receiving a Lawyer's Advice	241
12.5	LAWYERS' ACTS.....	243
 CHAPTER 13: CONTENT: LEGAL ADVICE REQUIREMENT		
13.1	INTRODUCTION	245
13.2	COMMON MISPERCEPTIONS ABOUT THE PRIVILEGE	245
13.3	COMMUNICATIONS DESERVING PRIVILEGE PROTECTION	248

TABLE OF CONTENTS

13.4	BASIC PRINCIPLES	249
13.401	Introduction	249
13.402	No Automatic Protection.....	249
13.403	Key Legal Advice Requirement	249
13.404	No Protection for Non-Substantive Logistical Communications.....	250
13.405	No Protection for Communications About Deposition or Trial Dates.....	251
13.406	Not Dependent on Anticipated Litigation	251
13.407	Communications Between Lawyer and Third Parties	251
13.408	Protections Available for Communications with Third Parties	252
13.5	ANALYZING EACH COMMUNICATION	253
13.501	Introduction	253
13.502	Attachments	253
13.503	Transmittal Communications to or from Lawyers.....	253
13.504	Lawyers as Copy Recipients	255
13.505	Meetings Attended by Lawyers.....	255
13.6	ANALYZING A SINGLE COMMUNICATION	256
13.601	Introduction	256
13.602	Judicial Disagreement on Analysis of Single Communications	256
13.603	Email Strings.....	257
13.604	Redaction	258
 CHAPTER 14: ANALYZING THE LAWYER'S ROLE		
14.1	INTRODUCTION	259
14.2	LAWYER'S ROLE IS NOT DISPOSITIVE.....	260
14.201	Introduction	260
14.202	Lawyer's Participation	260
14.203	Lawyer's Title	260
14.204	Services That Could Be Performed by Nonlawyers	260
14.3	LAWYERS INVOLVED IN INVESTIGATIONS.....	261
14.301	Introduction	261
14.302	Lawyers as Investigators	261
14.303	Lawyers Involved in Tax Issues	264
14.304	Lawyers Involved in Patents	265
14.4	LAWYERS INVOLVED IN OTHER MATTERS	267
14.401	Introduction	267
14.402	Lawyers Working for Accounting Firms	267
14.403	Lawyers Playing a Lobbying/Public Relations Role.....	267
14.404	Lawyers Playing Other Roles	269
14.5	IN-HOUSE LAWYERS	272
14.501	Introduction	272
14.502	General Rule Recognizing In-House Lawyers' Privilege	272

TABLE OF CONTENTS

14.503	In-House Lawyers Acting as Legal Advisor and Business Advisor	273
14.504	Courts' Analysis of Nature of Advice	274
14.505	Presumptions Regarding Privilege	276
14.506	Higher Burden of Proof.....	277
14.507	Judicial Criticism of In-House Lawyers' Privilege Claims.....	279
14.508	Foreign In-House Lawyers	279
14.6	LAWYERS AS CONDUITS TO OR FROM CLIENTS.....	280
14.7	WORK PRODUCT.....	280
CHAPTER 15: BUSINESS AND OTHER NONLEGAL ADVICE		
15.1	INTRODUCTION	281
15.2	DISTINGUISHING BETWEEN LEGAL AND BUSINESS ADVICE	282
15.201	Introduction	282
15.202	Non-Dispositive Factors.....	282
15.203	The "Primary Purpose" Test.....	283
15.204	Broad View of the "Primary Purpose" Test	284
15.205	Narrow View of the "Primary Purpose" Test.....	287
15.3	APPLYING THE "PRIMARY PURPOSE" TEST	287
15.301	Introduction	287
15.302	Examining Each Communication as a Whole	287
15.303	Examining Portions of a Single Communication	289
15.304	Other Approaches.....	290
15.4	WIDESPREAD INTRACORPORATE CIRCULATION	291
15.401	Introduction	291
15.402	Pre- <i>Vioxx</i> Decisions	292
15.403	<i>Vioxx</i> Decision.....	292
15.404	Decisions That Take the <i>Vioxx</i> Approach	294
15.405	Post- <i>Vioxx</i> Decisions Rejecting the <i>Vioxx</i> Approach	296
15.406	Analysis.....	296
15.5	OTHER TYPES OF NONLEGAL ADVICE	297
CHAPTER 16: CLIENT-TO-LAWYER COMMUNICATIONS		
16.1	INTRODUCTION	301
16.2	UNCOMMUNICATED CLIENT DOCUMENTS	302
16.201	Introduction	302
16.202	Statements Prepared Before Client-Lawyer Discussions.....	303
16.203	Statements Prepared During or After Client-Lawyer Discussions	305

TABLE OF CONTENTS

16.3	CLIENT-TO-CLIENT COMMUNICATIONS	306
16.301	Introduction	306
16.302	Communications Occurring Before a Lawyer's Involvement	306
16.303	Documents Memorializing Client-Lawyer Discussion	308
16.304	Communications Occurring After the Lawyer's Involvement	308
16.4	CLIENT'S EXPLICIT OR IMPLICIT REQUEST FOR LEGAL ADVICE: INTRODUCTION	310
16.401	Introduction	310
16.402	Request for Legal Advice Rather Than Other Advice	311
16.403	Unprotected Communications About Obtaining Legal Advice	311
16.404	Explicit Request for Legal Advice	311
16.405	Implicit Request for Legal Advice	311
16.406	Lawyer as a Copy Recipient	313
16.407	Sources of Proof	313
16.5	UNPROTECTED HISTORICAL FACTS	316
16.501	Introduction	316
16.502	General Rule	317
16.503	Discovery to Seek Historical Facts	318
16.504	Discovery of Historical Facts from the Lawyer	319
16.505	Privilege Protection for the Fact of a Communication	321
16.6	PRE-EXISTING DOCUMENTS RECEIVED FROM CLIENT	321
16.601	Introduction	321
16.602	Privilege Protection Unavailable for Pre-Existing Documents	321
16.603	New Trend May Protect Pre-Existing Emails	325
16.7	CLIENT'S NON-SUBSTANTIVE COMMUNICATIONS	327
16.8	CLIENT COMMUNICATIONS RELAYING HISTORICAL FACTS	328
16.801	Introduction	328
16.802	Documents Held to Be Privileged	328
16.803	Documents Held Not to Be Privileged	330
16.9	REVIEW OF DRAFT DOCUMENTS	332
16.901	Introduction	332
16.902	Drafts Not Yet Sent to a Lawyer	333
16.903	Work-in-Process Draft Versus Final Draft	334
16.904	Client-Created Drafts	335
16.905	Source of Proof	336
16.906	Drafts Disseminated to Third Parties	338
16.907	Scope of Protection if Privilege Protection Is Available	341
16.10	DRAFTS CLIENTS INTEND TO DISCLOSE	342
16.11	CLIENTS' ACTS AFTER ADVICE IS RECEIVED	342

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 17: LAWYER-TO-CLIENT COMMUNICATIONS

17.1	INTRODUCTION	343
17.2	UNCOMMUNICATED LAWYER DOCUMENTS	344
17.201	Introduction	344
17.202	Documents Held to Be Privileged.....	344
17.203	Documents Held Not to Be Privileged	344
17.3	LAWYER-TO-LAWYER COMMUNICATIONS	346
17.301	Introduction	346
17.302	Protected Lawyer-to-Lawyer Communications	347
17.303	Unprotected Lawyer-to-Lawyer Communications	348
17.304	Work Product.....	348
17.4	RULES GOVERNING LAWYER-TO-CLIENT COMMUNICATIONS	348
17.401	Introduction	348
17.402	Standards for Protecting Lawyer-to-Client Communications.....	348
17.403	Other Related Issues	351
17.5	LAWYERS' REQUESTS FOR FACTS FROM CLIENTS	352
17.6	HISTORICAL FACTS	353
17.7	HISTORICAL FACTS WITHIN THE LAWYER'S KNOWLEDGE	353
17.701	Introduction	353
17.702	Historical Facts Not Shared with Clients.....	354
17.703	Historical Facts Given to Clients as Conduits	355
17.704	Legal Advice and Historical Facts.....	357
17.705	Deposition Questions Posed to Clients	361
17.706	Depositions of Lawyers	363
17.8	PRE-EXISTING DOCUMENTS THAT LAWYERS GIVE TO THEIR CLIENTS	363
17.9	LAWYER'S DOCUMENTS RELAYING FACTS TO CLIENTS.....	364
17.10	DRAFTS	366
17.1001	Introduction	366
17.1002	The Nature of Lawyer-Created Drafts.....	366
17.11	PROTECTION FOR LAWYER-CREATED DRAFTS	367
17.1101	Protection for Lawyer Changes on Client-Created Drafts	368
17.1102	Intent to Disclose.....	370
17.12	LEGAL ADVICE: GENERAL RULES.....	371
17.1201	Introduction	371
17.1202	Legal Versus Other Advice	371
17.1203	Legal Advice Disclosing Client Confidences.....	371

TABLE OF CONTENTS

17.13	PROTECTED AND UNPROTECTED LAWYER ADVICE.....	372
17.1301	Protected Advice Disclosed by Lawyer Revisions.....	372
17.1302	Non-Substantive Communications	372
17.1303	Unprotected Advice About Internal Corporate Regulations	373
17.1304	Unprotected Abstract or Generic Advice	374
17.1305	Required Specificity of Privileged Advice	375
17.1306	Privilege Protection for Terse Legal Advice	377
17.14	LAWYER'S ACTIONS.....	379
17.15	EXPECTATION OF DISCLOSURE.....	379
17.16	DISCOVERY ABOUT DISCOVERY	380
17.17	WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION.....	380
CHAPTER 18: THE CRIME-FRAUD EXCEPTION		
18.1	INTRODUCTION	381
18.2	APPLICABILITY TO FUTURE WRONGDOING	381
18.3	WRONGDOING COVERED BY THE EXCEPTION	383
18.301	Introduction	383
18.302	Crimes	383
18.303	Fraud.....	383
18.304	Other Misconduct	384
18.305	Sufficient Allegation of Wrongdoing	388
18.306	Completion of Wrongdoing	388
18.307	Communications as Evidence of Wrongdoing	389
18.4	CONNECTION BETWEEN THE WRONGDOING AND THE COMMUNICATION.....	389
18.401	Introduction	389
18.402	Types of Communications.....	390
18.403	Narrow "Furtherance" Standard.....	391
18.404	Broad "Relationship" Standard	393
18.5	KNOWLEDGE OF THE WRONGDOING	394
18.501	Client's Knowledge.....	394
18.502	Lawyer's Knowledge.....	394
18.503	Work Product Doctrine	395
18.6	APPLYING THE EXCEPTION	395
18.601	Introduction	395
18.602	Communication-by-Communication Analysis	395
18.7	PROCESS FOR APPLYING THE EXCEPTION.....	395
18.8	LATER ATTEMPTS TO ESTABLISH THE EXCEPTION	396

TABLE OF CONTENTS

18.9	FIRST STEP: <i>IN CAMERA</i> REVIEW	396
18.901	<i>United States v. Zolin</i>	396
18.902	Lower Standard Justifying <i>In Camera</i> Review	397
18.903	Discretionary or Mandatory <i>In Camera</i> Review	398
18.10	SECOND STEP: EVIDENCE AND HEARING.....	399
18.1001	Evidence.....	399
18.1002	Hearing	400
18.11	STANDARD FOR OVERCOMING THE PRIVILEGE	402
18.1101	Introduction	402
18.1102	Selecting the Standard.....	402
18.1103	Defining the Standard	405
18.12	EXPANSION OF THE EXCEPTION	405
CHAPTER 19: PRESENCE OF THIRD PARTIES		
19.1	INTRODUCTION	407
19.2	“EXPECTATION OF CONFIDENTIALITY” ELEMENT.....	408
19.3	CHARACTERIZING THIRD PARTIES’ INVOLVEMENT	408
19.4	EXPECTATION OF CONFIDENTIALITY VERSUS WAIVER.....	409
19.5	SLOPPY HANDLING OF PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS	411
19.6	UNINVITED THIRD PARTIES	413
19.601	Uninvited Third Parties Whose Presence Is Obvious.....	413
19.602	Evidence of Third-Party Disclosure.	413
19.603	Eavesdroppers	415
19.7	INVITED THIRD PARTIES	415
19.701	Introduction	415
19.702	Characterizing the Third Party.....	416
19.703	Establishing the Third Party’s Role and Presence	416
19.8	INTRACORPORATE COMMUNICATIONS WITH CORPORATE EMPLOYEES.....	417
19.801	Introduction	417
19.802	Effect of the “Control Group” or the <i>Upjohn</i> Standard.....	418
19.803	Analyzing Employees’ “Need to Know.”	418
19.804	Employees’ Access to Privileged Communications.....	420
19.805	Effect of an Adverse Employee’s or Former Employee’s Presence	421
19.806	Presence of Other Client Agents in the Corporate Setting	423
19.9	INVITED CLIENT AGENTS.....	423
19.901	Introduction	423
19.902	Level of “Necessity” Required.....	423

TABLE OF CONTENTS

19.903	Client Agents Within the Privilege	425
19.904	Clients Agents Outside of the Privilege.....	426
19.10	FAMILY MEMBERS	429
19.1001	Introduction	429
19.1002	Facts About the Family Member's Role.....	429
19.1003	Family Members Inside the Privilege	430
19.1004	Family Members Outside of the Privilege	430
19.1005	Spouses.....	431
19.11	INVITED LAWYER AGENTS	432
19.1101	Introduction	432
19.1102	Lawyer's Staff	433
19.1103	Other Lawyer Agents	434
19.1104	"Need" Analysis	434
19.12	ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS	434
19.13	PERSONAL COMMUNICATIONS ON WORK COMPUTERS	435
19.14	SLOPPY DESTRUCTION OF PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS	441
19.15	WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE.....	443
 CHAPTER 20: THE JOINT DEFENSE/COMMON INTEREST DOCTRINE		
20.1	INTRODUCTION	445
20.2	COMMON INTEREST DOCTRINE VERSUS JOINT REPRESENTATIONS.....	445
20.201	Introduction	445
20.202	Key Differences.....	447
20.203	Advantages of a Joint Representation	448
20.3	HISTORY OF THE COMMON INTEREST DOCTRINE	449
20.4	NATURE OF THE PROTECTION.....	450
20.401	Introduction	450
20.402	Intrinsically Privileged Communications	451
20.403	Degree of Confidentiality Required.....	452
20.5	LITIGATION ELEMENT	453
20.501	Introduction	453
20.502	Courts Not Recognizing the Doctrine	453
20.503	Courts Requiring Active Ongoing Litigation.....	453
20.504	Courts Analyzing Each Participant's Involvement	454
20.505	Courts Protecting Non-Litigants.....	458
20.506	Courts Applying the Doctrine Outside the Litigation Setting	460

TABLE OF CONTENTS

20.6	CREATION OF THE PROTECTION.....	463
20.601	Introduction	463
20.602	Requirement of a “Meeting of the Minds.”	463
20.603	No Requirement of Written Agreement.....	465
20.604	Privilege Protection for Written Agreement.....	466
20.605	Work Product Protection for Written Agreement	468
20.7	TYPES OF COMMON INTEREST SUPPORTING AGREEMENT.....	469
20.8	DEGREE OF COMMONALITY REQUIRED	472
20.801	Introduction	472
20.802	Requiring an “Identical” Interest	472
20.803	Requiring Less Than an “Identical” Interest.....	473
20.804	Agreements Between Transactional Adversaries	476
20.805	Agreements Between Litigation Adversaries.....	477
20.806	Conclusion.....	478
20.9	LAWYERS’ INVOLVEMENT	479
20.901	Introduction	479
20.902	Necessity of a Lawyer’s Involvement	479
20.10	COURTS’ APPLICATION OF THE DOCTRINE	481
20.1001	Introduction	481
20.1002	Courts’ Communication by Communication Analysis	481
20.1003	Courts’ Selection of a Different Effective Date.....	484
20.11	EXAMPLES OF ASSERTIONS OF THE DOCTRINE	486
20.1101	Introduction	486
20.1102	Successful Common Interest Agreements	486
20.1103	Unsuccessful Common Interest Agreements.....	490
20.12	DANGER OF A SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER.....	496
20.13	APPLICABILITY IN THE INSURANCE CONTEXT.....	497
20.1301	Introduction	497
20.1302	Broad View.....	497
20.1303	Narrow View	498
20.1304	Aggressive Use of the Doctrine.....	499
20.1305	Work Product Doctrine Issues	500
20.14	LATER ADVERSITY AMONG PARTICIPANTS.....	500
20.1401	Introduction	500
20.1402	Effect of Later Adversity.....	500
20.1403	Aggressive Use of the Doctrine.....	500
20.1404	Effect of Later Adversity on Lawyers	501
20.15	DISCOVERY ABOUT DISCOVERY	503
20.16	WORK PRODUCT.....	503

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 21: INTENT TO DISCLOSE CONTENT

21.1	INTRODUCTION	507
21.2	INTENT TO DISCLOSE VERSUS WAIVER	508
21.3	DOCUMENTS	510
21.4	INFORMATION	512
21.5	COMMUNICATIONS.....	515
21.6	RELATED COMMUNICATIONS	516
21.7	PRELIMINARY DRAFTS OF DOCUMENTS	518
21.701	Introduction	518
21.702	Courts Protecting Entire Drafts	519
21.703	Courts Protecting Only Undisclosed Portions of Drafts	523
21.704	Courts Not Protecting Drafts	525
21.705	Conclusion.....	527
21.8	PRIVILEGED DOCUMENTS THAT WILL BE USED AT TRIAL.....	527
21.9	WORK PRODUCT	530

CHAPTER 22: INTERNAL CORPORATE INVESTIGATIONS AND INSURANCE

22.1	INTRODUCTION	531
22.2	EARLY DECISIONS IN THE INVESTIGATION CONTEXT	532
22.3	COMMUNICATIONS ABOUT THE INVESTIGATION	533
22.4	FACTS AND LOGISTICS OF THE INVESTIGATION.....	533
22.5	INTERNAL CORPORATE INVESTIGATIONS: INTRODUCTION	534
22.6	INITIATION OF THE INVESTIGATION	534
22.7	COURSE OF THE INVESTIGATION	539
22.8	USE OF THE INVESTIGATION	542
22.9	“MORPHED” INVESTIGATIONS WITH CHANGING MOTIVATIONS.....	543
22.10	PARALLEL OR SUCCESSIVE INVESTIGATIONS	544
22.11	EXAMPLES OF INTERNAL CORPORATE INVESTIGATIONS	545
22.1101	Introduction	545
22.1102	Successful Privilege Claims	545
22.1103	Unsuccessful Privilege Claims	546

TABLE OF CONTENTS

22.12	WAIVER IN THE INVESTIGATION CONTEXT	547
22.13	WORK PRODUCT IN THE INVESTIGATION CONTEXT	548
22.14	PRIVILEGE PROTECTION IN THE INSURANCE CONTEXT	548
22.1401	Introduction	548
22.1402	Existence of Attorney-Client Relationships.....	549
22.1403	Privilege Protection Without an Attorney-Client Relationship	549
22.1404	Insurance Company Employees as Protected Client Agents	551
22.1405	Insurance Company Employees as Protected Lawyer Agents	551
22.1406	Common Interest Doctrine	551
22.1407	Work Product.....	552
 CHAPTER 23: WAIVER OF THE PRIVILEGE		
23.1	INTRODUCTION	553
23.2	PRIVILEGE CAN BE UNAVAILABLE OR LOST.....	553
23.3	NO NEED FOR CLIENT INTENT TO WAIVE	554
23.4	WAIVER CHAPTERS OF THIS BOOK.....	555
 CHAPTER 24: POWER TO WAIVE THE PRIVILEGE		
24.1	INTRODUCTION	557
24.2	INDIVIDUALS AND THEIR SUCCESSORS.....	557
24.201	Introduction	557
24.202	Bankrupt Individuals.....	558
24.203	Deceased Individuals' Successors.....	559
24.204	Adversity Between Successors and the Deceased Individual	560
24.205	Adversity Among Beneficiaries	560
24.3	JOINTLY REPRESENTED CLIENTS	562
24.301	Introduction	562
24.302	Joint Client's Own Communications.....	563
24.303	Waiver for Joint Communications	564
24.304	Later Dispute with Other Jointly Represented Clients.....	566
24.305	The Effect of a Lawyer's Improper Joint Representation.....	569
24.306	Waiver in a Dispute with Another Former Joint Client.....	570
24.4	JOINT DEFENSE/COMMON INTEREST PARTICIPANTS.....	571
24.401	Introduction	571
24.402	Participants' Own Communications	572
24.403	Unanimity Required to Waive Joint Communications.....	572
24.404	Unshared Communications	573
24.405	Degree of Adversity Required.....	573
24.406	Default Rules Altered by Contract.....	574

TABLE OF CONTENTS

24.5	GOVERNMENT CLIENTS.....	575
24.501	Introduction	575
24.502	Level of Government Employee.....	575
24.503	Multimember Government Entities.....	576
24.504	Inadvertent Disclosure.....	577
24.6	CORPORATE CLIENTS.....	577
24.601	Introduction	577
24.602	Successor Management.....	578
24.603	Jointly Represented Corporations.....	578
24.604	Jointly Represented Corporations and Employees	578
24.605	Loyal Current Employees	579
24.606	Loyal Current Employees Who Become Adverse	582
24.607	Adverse Current Employees.....	584
24.608	Loyal Former Employees	585
24.609	Adverse Former Employees	586
24.610	Former Employees' Use of Privileged Communications.....	587
24.611	Access by Former Employees to Corporation's Privileged Communications.....	588
24.7	OTHER CLIENTS.....	588
24.8	LAWYERS.....	588
24.801	Introduction	588
24.802	Lawyers Acting with Clients' Express Authority.....	588
24.803	Lawyers Acting with Clients' Implied Authority	589
24.804	Lawyers Acting Without Authority.....	591
24.805	Other Doctrines Allowing Disclosure by Lawyers	591
24.806	Work Product.....	592
24.9	OTHERS.....	592
24.10	WORK PRODUCT.....	592
CHAPTER 25: EXPRESS WAIVER		
25.1	INTRODUCTION	593
25.2	DIFFERENT TYPES OF EXPRESS WAIVERS	594
25.3	DISCLOSURE DOES NOT AUTOMATICALLY WAIVE PRIVILEGE	594
25.4	HOW WAIVER CAN OCCUR.....	595
25.5	DISCLOSURE VERSUS MERE ACCESS TO A COMMUNICATION	596
25.501	Introduction	596
25.502	Disclosure Versus Access	596
25.503	Intent to Disclose Contrasted	597
25.504	Ethics Issues	598

TABLE OF CONTENTS

25.6	DISCLOSURE OF NON-PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS OR FACTS.....	598
25.601	Introduction	598
25.602	Non-Privileged Communications.....	598
25.603	Fact of a Privileged Communication	599
25.604	Non-Protected Historical Facts	600
25.605	Historical Facts Involved in an Investigation	601
25.606	Historical Facts Disclosed to the Government	603
25.607	Communications Reflecting a Lawyer's Advice.....	605
25.608	Submission of "Position Papers" to the Government	606
25.609	Denial of a Communication with a Lawyer	606
25.610	Avoiding Subject Matter Waiver	607
25.611	Reversal of Positions to Avoid a Subject Matter Waiver	607
25.7	DISCLOSURE OF THE "GIST" OF A PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATION.....	610
25.701	Introduction	610
25.702	Subject Matter of a Privileged Communication	611
25.703	The "Gist" Standard	612
25.704	Examples of Insufficient Specificity to Cause a Waiver	612
25.705	Analogy to Privilege Log Entries.....	615
25.706	Relationship to Implied Waiver.....	616
25.8	VOLUNTARY VERSUS COMPELLED DISCLOSURE.....	616
25.801	Introduction	616
25.802	Significance of the Distinction.....	617
25.803	Application in the Discovery Context	618
25.804	Application in the Deposition Context.....	620
25.805	Required Extent of Resistance to Discovery	621
25.806	Other Examples of Possible Compulsion	623
25.807	Order Denying Protection May Not Compel Production	625
25.9	DISCLOSING PARTY'S DISCLAIMER OF A WAIVER	625
25.10	EFFECT OF A CONFIDENTIALITY WARNING	625
25.11	EFFECT OF A CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT.....	626
25.1101	Introduction	626
25.1102	Disclosure to the Government	627
25.1103	Possible Benefits of Confidentiality Agreements	627
25.1104	Type of Litigation as a Key Factor	627
25.12	COURT ORDERS PURPORTING TO ALLOW SELECTIVE WAIVERS.....	627
25.13	NORMAL EFFECT OF AN EXPRESS WAIVER.....	628
25.1301	Introduction	628
25.1302	General Rule	628
25.1303	No Automatic Waiver in Other Proceedings	629

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 26: INTENTIONAL EXPRESS WAIVER

26.1	INTRODUCTION	631
26.2	ANALYSIS OF THE EFFECT OF DISCLOSURE.....	632
26.3	DISCLOSURE IN THE LITIGATION CONTEXT.....	632
26.301	Introduction	632
26.302	Courts.....	633
26.303	Grand Jury.....	634
26.304	Public Pleadings	634
26.305	Testimony in Court or at a Deposition.....	635
26.306	Testifying Experts	635
26.307	Document Production.....	635
26.308	Other Discovery	635
26.309	Witnesses	636
26.310	Adversaries in Settlement Negotiations	636
26.4	DISCLOSURE TO THE GOVERNMENT: STATUTES	636
26.401	Introduction	636
26.402	Federal Statutes Governing Financial Institutions.....	637
26.403	State Statutes	638
26.5	DISCLOSURE TO THE GOVERNMENT: COMMON LAW.....	639
26.501	Introduction	639
26.502	Government as a Regular Litigant	639
26.503	Intragovernment Disclosure.....	639
26.504	Government Seizure of Documents.....	640
26.505	Majority View Finding a Waiver.....	640
26.506	Minority View Finding No Waiver	643
26.507	Work Product.....	645
26.6	FEDERAL RULE OF EVIDENCE 502: SELECTIVE WAIVERS.....	645
26.601	Introduction	645
26.602	Abandoned “Selective Waiver” Provision.....	645
26.603	Post-Rule 502 “Selective Waiver” Orders	646
26.7	FACTS DISCLOSED TO THE GOVERNMENT.....	646
26.8	CORPORATE NEGOTIATIONS OR TRANSACTIONS.....	646
26.801	Introduction	646
26.802	Disclosure During Transaction Negotiations	646
26.803	Disclosure During Due Diligence	647
26.804	Company’s Acquisition of Undisclosed Communications	649
26.805	Disclosure to Other Third Parties.....	650
26.806	Other Corporate Transactions.....	650
26.807	Work Product Protection.....	651

TABLE OF CONTENTS

26.9	INTRACORPORATE DISCLOSURE.....	651
26.901	Introduction	651
26.902	Affiliated Corporations.....	651
26.903	Disclosure Under the “Control Group” Standard.....	652
26.904	Disclosure Under the “Upjohn” Standard.....	653
26.905	Disclosure to Employees Who Later Become Adverse	655
26.906	Disclosure to Adverse Current Employees	656
26.907	Disclosure to Independent Contractors	657
26.908	Disclosure to Loyal Former Employees	657
26.909	Disclosure to Adverse Former Employees	659
26.910	Disclosure by Adverse Former Employees	659
26.911	Shareholders	659
26.912	Disclosure to Corporate Agents.....	660
26.10	CORPORATE AND OTHER CLIENT AGENTS.....	660
26.1001	Introduction	660
26.1002	Clients Agents’ Changing Roles	660
26.1003	Auditors.....	661
26.1004	Accountants	661
26.1005	Investment Bankers.....	662
26.1006	Public Relations Consultants	663
26.1007	Other Agents Assisting Corporations	663
26.1008	Insurance Context	666
26.1009	Other Agents and Consultants.....	667
26.11	DISCLOSURE TO LAWYER AGENTS	668
26.1101	Introduction	668
26.1102	Lawyers’ Staff.....	668
26.1103	Agents Assisting the Lawyer in Providing Legal Advice.....	669
26.1104	Assessing a Lawyer’s “Need” for an Agent’s Assistance	670
26.12	OTHER RELATIONSHIPS	671
26.1201	Introduction	671
26.1202	Jointly Represented Clients	671
26.1203	Participants in a Common Interest Arrangement	671
26.1204	Other Lawyers	672
26.1205	Parties Subject to the “Fiduciary Exception.”	673
26.1206	Bankruptcy Setting	673
26.1207	Members of an Unincorporated Association.....	674
26.1208	Family Members.....	674
26.1209	Other Privileged Relationships	676
26.13	DISCLOSURE IN OTHER CONTEXTS.....	676
26.1301	Introduction	676
26.1302	Public Statements	676
26.1303	Other Third Parties.....	677

TABLE OF CONTENTS

26.14	SELECTIVE WAIVERS PRE- AND POST-RULE 502	678
26.1401	Introduction	678
26.1402	Pre-Rule 502 Judicial Reliance on Common Law Principles	678
26.1403	Post-Rule 502 Court Orders	679
26.1404	Conclusion.....	683
26.15	SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER	684
26.16	WORK PRODUCT.....	684
CHAPTER 27: INADVERTENT EXPRESS WAIVER		
27.1	INTRODUCTION	685
27.2	PRESENCE OF THIRD PARTIES ELEMENT.....	686
27.3	“INTENT TO DISCLOSE” ELEMENT	687
27.4	ETHICS ISSUES	688
27.401	Introduction	688
27.402	ABA Model Rules	688
27.403	State Bar Opinions.....	689
27.404	Courts’ Approach.....	690
27.405	Conclusion.....	690
27.5	UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE.....	690
27.6	POST-PRODUCTION PRIVILEGE ASSERTIONS.....	691
27.601	Introduction	691
27.602	Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B).....	691
27.603	State Rules.....	692
27.7	MEANING OF “INADVERTENT”	692
27.701	Introduction	692
27.702	Possible Meaning of “Inadvertent.”	692
27.703	“Inadvertent” Refers to Physical Act of Disclosure	695
27.8	DOCUMENT PRODUCTIONS PRE-RULE 502	695
27.801	Introduction	695
27.802	Courts’ Three Standards.....	695
27.9	FEDERAL RULE OF EVIDENCE 502	696
27.901	Introduction	696
27.902	Disclosures Governed by Rule 502	696
27.10	APPLICATION OF RULE 502	697
27.1001	Introduction	697
27.1002	Rule 502’s Core Provision	697
27.1003	Continued Use of the Pre-502 Standards and Case Law	698

TABLE OF CONTENTS

27.11	INADVERTENCE FACTOR	699
27.1101	Introduction	699
27.1102	Mistakes in Document Productions	699
27.1103	Rule 502's "Inadvertent" Reference	700
27.12	REASONABLE STEPS TO PREVENT DISCLOSURE.....	701
27.1201	Introduction	701
27.1202	Role of Paralegals.....	701
27.1203	Lawyers' Review of the Documents.....	702
27.1204	Privilege Labels	703
27.1205	Inclusion of Documents on a Privilege Log.....	704
27.1206	Re-review of Documents	705
27.1207	Other Factors.....	706
27.1208	Required Explanation of the Review Process	707
27.13	NUMBER OF DISCLOSURES	709
27.1301	Introduction	709
27.1302	Number of Mistakes	709
27.1303	Percentage of Inadvertently Produced Documents	709
27.14	PROMPTNESS OF REMEDIAL MEASURES	712
27.1401	Introduction	712
27.1402	When the Calculation Begins	712
27.1403	Actions Which Satisfy the Standard	712
27.1404	Time Allowed for Remedial Measures	716
27.15	OTHER FACTORS	718
27.1501	Introduction	718
27.1502	Breadth of Disclosure	718
27.1503	Prejudice to the Receiving Litigant.....	719
27.1504	Other Factors.....	720
27.16	NON-WAIVER: CLAWBACK AGREEMENTS AND COURT ORDERS	722
27.1601	Introduction	722
27.1602	Pre-Rule 502 Agreements	722
27.1603	Pre-Rule 502 Court Orders	722
27.1604	Federal Rules Governing Agreements and Court Orders	723
27.1605	Post-Rule 502 Private Agreements	723
27.1606	Post-Rule 502 Orders	724
27.1607	Intentional Production of Privileged Documents	728
27.17	THE CLAWBACK DILEMMA.....	728
27.18	OTHER INADVERTENT DISCLOSURE.....	729
27.19	EFFECT OF AN INADVERTENT DISCLOSURE	731
27.20	SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER	732
27.21	WORK PRODUCT	732

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 28: IMPLIED WAIVER

28.1	INTRODUCTION	735
28.2	IMPLIED VERSUS EXPRESS WAIVER	735
28.3	OTHER UNINTENTIONAL DISCLOSURES.....	736
28.4	DIFFERENCE BETWEEN IMPLIED WAIVER AND A LITIGANT'S FAILURE OF PROOF IN SUPPORTING A PRIVILEGE CLAIM.....	737
28.5	RULE 502.....	737
28.6	THE "AT ISSUE" DOCTRINE	738
28.7	CLIENTS' ATTACKS ON LAWYERS AND LEGAL ADVICE.....	738
28.701	Introduction	738
28.702	Clients' Malpractice Claims Against Their Lawyers	738
28.703	Ineffective Assistance of Counsel Claims	739
28.704	Clients' Other Claims Against Their Lawyers	739
28.8	THIRD PARTIES' ATTACKS ON LAWYERS.....	740
28.801	Introduction	740
28.802	Ethics Issues	740
28.803	Implied Waiver of the Privilege Protection	741
28.9	LAWYERS' ATTACKS ON CLIENTS.....	742
28.901	Introduction	742
28.902	Lawyers' Claims for Attorney's Fees from Clients.....	743
28.903	In-House Lawyers' Wrongful Termination Claims	743
28.10	CLIENT CLAIMS FOR ATTORNEY FEES	745
28.1001	Introduction	745
28.1002	Application.....	745
28.11	RELIANCE ON LEGAL ADVICE AS AN AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE	749
28.1101	Introduction	749
28.1102	"Advice of Counsel" Defense	749
28.1103	Litigants' Changing Positions	750
28.12	RELIANCE ON LEGAL ADVICE IN OTHER CONTEXTS	752
28.1201	Introduction	752
28.1202	Explicit Reliance on Legal Advice in Litigation	752
28.1203	Explicit Reference to Legal Advice in Litigation.....	754
28.1204	Litigants' Ability to Avoid an Implied Waiver	755
28.13	DEPOSITION REFERENCES TO PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS.....	755
28.1301	Introduction	755
28.1302	Relationship of Express and Implied Waiver	755

TABLE OF CONTENTS

28.1303	Application.....	755
28.1304	Litigants' Efforts to Avoid a Waiver.....	758
28.14	CLIENTS' DENIAL OF COMMUNICATIONS WITH A LAWYER	758
28.1401	Introduction	758
28.1402	Denial of Communications with a Lawyer	759
28.1403	Clients' Lack of Memory of a Communication.....	760
28.1404	Relationship to the "At Issue" Doctrine.....	760
28.15	CLIENTS' DESIGNATION OF A LAWYER AS A WITNESS	760
28.1501	Introduction	760
28.1502	Lawyer as a Witness to Non-Privileged Communications	761
28.1503	Lawyer as a Witness on Other Topics.....	761
28.1504	Lawyers as Attesting Witnesses	762
28.1505	Lawyers' Verification of Discovery Responses.....	762
28.16	RELIANCE ON LEGAL ADVICE OUTSIDE COURT PROCEEDINGS	763
28.17	PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS USED AT TRIAL	765
28.18	"AT ISSUE" WAIVER	765
28.19	FEDERAL RULE OF EVIDENCE 612.....	766
28.1901	Introduction	766
28.1902	Proper Characterization of Rule 612	766
28.1903	Application to Depositions	767
28.1904	Requirement That the Document Refresh Recollection.....	767
28.1905	The "Justice Requires" Standard	769
28.1906	Functional/Impact Standard	769
28.1907	Substantial Need Standard	770
28.1908	<i>In Camera</i> Review	771
28.1909	Examples.....	771
28.1910	Scope of Waiver	772
28.1911	Work Product.....	772
28.20	EFFECT OF IMPLIED WAIVER.....	772
28.21	SCOPE OF IMPLIED WAIVER	772
28.22	WORK PRODUCT.....	772
CHAPTER 29: THE "AT ISSUE" DOCTRINE		
29.1	INTRODUCTION	773
29.2	CONFUSION ABOUT THE "AT ISSUE" DOCTRINE.....	773
29.3	NATURE OF THE "AT ISSUE" WAIVER DOCTRINE.....	774

TABLE OF CONTENTS

29.4	SPECTRUM OF JUDICIAL APPROACHES	774
29.401	Introduction	774
29.402	Explicit Reliance on Privileged Communications	775
29.403	“Anticipatory Waiver” Doctrine.....	777
29.404	The <i>Hearn</i> Doctrine.....	778
29.5	HEARN DOCTRINE AND RELEVANT FACTORS	778
29.501	Introduction	778
29.502	History of the <i>Hearn</i> Doctrine	778
29.503	Continuing Controversy Over the <i>Hearn</i> Doctrine	779
29.504	The Waiving Party Must Affirmatively Raise the Issue.....	779
29.505	The Issue Must Be More Than Just Relevant.....	781
29.506	Evidence Must Be Unavailable Elsewhere.....	782
29.6	HEARN DOCTRINE: ASSERTIONS OF KNOWLEDGE	783
29.601	Introduction	783
29.602	Assertions That Trigger an “At Issue” Waiver.....	783
29.603	Assertions That Do Not Trigger an “At Issue” Waiver	784
29.7	HEARN DOCTRINE: IGNORANCE.....	784
29.701	Introduction	784
29.702	Assertions That Trigger an “At Issue” Waiver.....	785
29.703	Assertions That Do Not Trigger an “At Issue” Waiver	789
29.704	Relationship to the Client’s Denial of Communications with a Lawyer.....	790
29.8	HEARN DOCTRINE: ACTION OR INACTION.....	790
29.801	Introduction	790
29.802	Assertions That Trigger an “At Issue” Waiver.....	790
29.803	Assertions That Do Not Trigger an “At Issue” Waiver.....	793
29.804	Relationship to the Client’s Denial of Communications with a Lawyer.....	794
29.9	THE FARAGHER/ELLERTH DEFENSE	794
29.10	HEARN DOCTRINE: OTHER EXAMPLES.....	795
29.11	ABILITY TO ABANDON ASSERTIONS OR DEFENSES.....	796
29.12	EFFECT OF AN “AT ISSUE” WAIVER	797
29.13	SCOPE OF POSSIBLE SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER	798
29.14	WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE.....	799
CHAPTER 30: SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER		
30.1	INTRODUCTION	801
30.2	FAIRNESS OF A SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER	801

TABLE OF CONTENTS

30.3	NECESSITY OF A WAIVER	802
30.301	Introduction	802
30.302	Necessity of a Waiver	803
30.303	Odd Reversal of Positions	803
30.304	Producing Party's Dilemma	805
30.4	INTENTIONAL EXPRESS WAIVER: JUDICIAL SETTING	806
30.401	Introduction	806
30.402	Testimonial Use of Privileged Communications	806
30.403	Non-Testimonial Disclosure During Litigation	806
30.404	Rule 502	807
30.405	Effect of Adversity Among Jointly Represented Clients	809
30.406	Disclosure to Testifying Experts	809
30.5	AVOIDING A SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER	809
30.501	Parties' Attempt to Avoid a Subject Matter Waiver	809
30.502	Court Orders	810
30.6	INTENTIONAL EXPRESS WAIVER: NON-JUDICIAL SETTING	810
30.601	Introduction	810
30.602	The <i>von Bulow</i> Case and Doctrine	810
30.603	Rule 502	811
30.604	Application of the <i>von Bulow</i> Doctrine	812
30.605	Courts Finding the <i>von Bulow</i> Doctrine Inapplicable	813
30.606	Courts Rejecting the <i>von Bulow</i> Doctrine	814
30.7	INADVERTENT EXPRESS WAIVER UNDER RULE 502	816
30.701	Introduction	816
30.702	Pre-Rule 502 Case Law	816
30.703	Federal Rule of Evidence 502	817
30.8	IMPLIED WAIVERS, "AT ISSUE" WAIVERS, AND RULE 612	818
30.801	Implied Waivers	818
30.802	"At Issue" Waivers	819
30.803	<i>Faragher/ Ellerth</i> Doctrine	820
30.804	Rule 612	820
30.9	WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE	820
CHAPTER 31: SCOPE OF A SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER		
31.1	INTRODUCTION	821
31.2	GENERAL APPROACH	821
31.3	TYPES OF SCOPE: HORIZONTAL AND TEMPORAL	823
31.301	Introduction	823
31.302	Horizontal Scope	823
31.303	Temporal Scope	824

TABLE OF CONTENTS

31.4	SCOPE OF INTENTIONAL EXPRESS WAIVERS	825
31.401	Introduction	825
31.402	Non-Patent Cases	825
31.403	Patent Cases	828
31.5	SCOPE OF INADVERTENT EXPRESS WAIVERS	831
31.6	SCOPE OF IMPLIED WAIVERS	832
31.601	Introduction	832
31.602	Difference in Assessing Scope of Waiver	832
31.603	Clients' Malpractice Actions Against Their Lawyers	832
31.604	Criminal Clients' Ineffective Assistance Claims	833
31.605	Reliance on Advice of Counsel	833
31.606	Rule 612	836
31.607	Other Examples	836
31.608	Testifying Experts	837
31.7	SCOPE OF "AT-ISSUE" WAIVERS	837
31.701	Introduction	837
31.702	<i>Faragher/ Ellerth</i> Doctrine	838
31.703	Other Examples	841
31.8	WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE	842
CHAPTER 32: WAIVER: NEW RULES AND PUBLIC POLICY DEBATES		
32.1	INTRODUCTION	845
32.2	FEDERAL RULES AND POST-PRODUCTION PRIVILEGE CLAIMS	845
32.3	FEDERAL RULE OF EVIDENCE 502	845
32.4	FEDERAL RULES GOVERNING TESTIFYING EXPERTS	847
32.5	GOVERNMENTAL REQUESTS FOR WAIVER OF PROTECTIONS	847
32.501	Introduction	847
32.502	Public Policy Debate	847
32.503	Federal Agency Actions	847
32.504	Proposed Federal Legislation	848
32.6	PROPOSALS ON SELECTIVE WAIVER BY CORPORATIONS	848
32.601	Introduction	848
32.602	Public Policy Debate	848
32.603	Federal Rule of Evidence 502	849
32.604	Other Federal and State Statutes and Regulations	849
32.7	CONCLUSION	849
INDEX		I-1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 33: WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE: HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

33.1	INTRODUCTION	851
33.2	COMMON LAW ANTECEDENTS.....	851
33.3	FIRST RECOGNIZED IN <i>HICKMAN V. TAYLOR</i>	852
33.4	FEDERAL RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE	855
33.401	Introduction	855
33.402	Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(3).....	855
33.403	2007 Stylistic Changes.....	856
33.404	Other Federal Rules.....	856
33.5	CONTINUING FEDERAL COMMON LAW PRINCIPLES	856
33.6	NAMING THE DOCTRINE.....	857
33.7	COMPARISON TO THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE	858
33.701	Introduction	858
33.702	Courts' Recognition of the Differences.....	858
33.703	Source of the Protection	859
33.704	Age.....	859
33.705	Purpose	859
33.706	Scope of the Work Product Doctrine Protection.	860
33.707	Intimacy of the Attorney-Client Relationship	861
33.708	Time of Applicability	861
33.709	Context Versus Content.....	861
33.710	Communications.....	862
33.711	Confidentiality	862
33.712	Level of Protection.....	862
33.713	Duration of Protection.....	862
33.8	AVAILABILITY OF BOTH PROTECTIONS	863
33.9	DIFFERING APPLICATIONS OF THE WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE	865

**CHAPTER 34: CREATING AND ASSERTING WORK PRODUCT
PROTECTION**

34.1	INTRODUCTION	869
34.2	CREATION OF PROTECTED WORK PRODUCT	869
34.3	LAWYER NEED NOT BE INVOLVED	871
34.4	ADVANTAGES OF A LAWYER'S INVOLVEMENT.....	875

TABLE OF CONTENTS

34.5	CLIENT AND LAWYER REPRESENTATIVES.....	875
34.501	Introduction	875
34.502	Clients' Representatives	876
34.503	Lawyers' Representatives	877
34.504	Irrelevance of Who Retains or Pays the Representative	879
34.6	FRIENDLY THIRD PARTIES' ROLE	880
34.7	NON-TESTIFYING EXPERTS	881
34.701	Introduction	881
34.702	Applicability of the Work Product Rule	881
34.703	Circumstances Justifying the Protection.....	883
34.704	Corporate Employees as Non-Testifying Experts	884
34.705	Non-Testifying Experts with Factual Knowledge	884
34.706	Experts Playing Dual Roles in the Same Matter	885
34.707	Experts Working at the Same Consulting Organization.....	886
34.708	Non-Testifying Experts Playing Different Roles.....	886
34.709	Non-Testifying Experts Who Become Testifying Experts	887
34.710	Testifying Experts Later De-Designated.....	888
34.711	Non-Testifying Experts' Identity and Existence	889
34.8	TESTIFYING EXPERTS	890
34.801	Introduction	890
34.802	Pre-2010 Debate Over Work Product Protection	890
34.803	Effect of 2010 Federal Rules Changes	891
34.804	Testifying Experts and Their Draft Documents.....	892
34.805	Documents Produced to a Testifying Expert	893
34.9	PARTIES' ASSERTION OF WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION	893
34.10	NON-PARTIES' ASSERTION OF WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION	894
34.1001	Introduction	894
34.1002	Party Representatives Can Create Protected Work Product	894
34.1003	Other Non-Parties Cannot Create Protected Work Product	895
34.1004	Exception: Non-Party Anticipating Litigation	895
34.1005	Conclusion.....	899
34.11	OWNERSHIP OF LAWYERS' FILES.....	899
34.1101	Introduction	899
34.1102	Ethics Rules	899
34.1103	Discovery Rules	900
 CHAPTER 35: CONTEXT AND TIMING OF WORK PRODUCT		
35.1	INTRODUCTION	903
35.2	PRIMACY OF CONTEXT OVER CONTENT.....	903
35.3	IRRELEVANCE OF AN ATTORNEY-CLIENT RELATIONSHIP	903

TABLE OF CONTENTS

35.4	IRRELEVANCE OF COMMUNICATION	904
35.5	IRRELEVANCE OF CONFIDENTIALITY	905
35.6	PRESENCE OF NON-ADVERSE THIRD PARTIES	907
35.7	JOINT DEFENSE/COMMON INTEREST AGREEMENTS	908
35.701	Introduction	908
35.702	Common Interest Agreements in the Work Product Context	908
35.703	Advantages of a Common Interest Agreement.....	909
35.704	Protection for the Common Interest Agreement Itself	909
35.8	CRITICAL ROLE OF TIMING	910
35.801	Introduction	910
35.802	Tension Between Confidentiality and Discovery	910
35.803	Inevitability of Litigants' Disclosure of Some Work Product	911
35.804	Rules Designating the Timing of Disclosure	913
35.805	Timing of Contention Interrogatories	914
35.806	Timing of Rule 30(b)(6) Depositions.....	914
35.807	Timing of Other Disclosures	914
35.9	WORK PRODUCT INTENDED FOR USE AT DEPOSITIONS	915
35.10	WORK PRODUCT INTENDED FOR USE AT TRIAL.....	915
CHAPTER 36: "LITIGATION" ELEMENT		
36.1	INTRODUCTION	919
36.2	RELATIONSHIP OF LITIGATION, ANTICIPATION AND MOTIVATION.....	919
36.3	JUDICIAL PROCEEDINGS	919
36.4	BANKRUPTCY PROCEEDINGS.....	920
36.5	NON-JUDICIAL PROCEEDINGS.....	921
36.501	Introduction	921
36.502	Other Proceedings Considered to Be Litigation.....	921
36.503	Non-Judicial Proceedings Not Considered to Be Litigation	924
36.6	GOVERNMENT INVESTIGATIONS	924
36.7	ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE.....	927
CHAPTER 37: "ANTICIPATION OF LITIGATION" ELEMENT		
37.1	INTRODUCTION	929
37.2	LITIGATION AND "ANTICIPATION" OF LITIGATION.....	930

TABLE OF CONTENTS

37.3	SUBJECTIVE AND OBJECTIVE ANTICIPATION.....	931
37.4	MOTIVATION TO SETTLE OR AVOID LITIGATION.....	932
37.5	REQUIREMENT OF A SPECIFIC IDENTIFIABLE CLAIM.....	934
37.501	Introduction	934
37.502	Courts' Differing Approaches to the Specific Claim Requirement	934
37.6	DEGREE OF ANTICIPATION OF LITIGATION.....	937
37.7	DATE AND DURATION OF ANTICIPATION	941
37.701	Introduction	941
37.702	Specific Date When Reasonable Anticipation of Litigation Began.....	941
37.703	Duration of "Reasonable Anticipation of Litigation."	942
37.8	TRIGGER EVENTS FOR REQUIRED ANTICIPATION.....	944
37.801	Introduction	944
37.802	Outside Incidents	945
37.803	Adversary's Actions	947
37.804	Litigant's Ordinary Course of Business Actions	954
37.805	Litigant's Litigation-Related Actions.....	957
37.9	RISK OF POSSIBLE SPOILIATION CLAIMS	961
37.901	Introduction	961
37.902	Obligation to Preserve Potential Evidence	961
37.903	Anticipation and the Duty to Preserve Documents	961
37.904	Required Disclosures.....	964
 CHAPTER 38: "MOTIVATION" ELEMENT		
38.1	INTRODUCTION.....	965
38.2	RELATIONSHIP TO ANTICIPATION OF LITIGATION ELEMENT.....	966
38.3	NECESSITY OF MEETING THE MOTIVATION STANDARD.....	967
38.4	DOCUMENTS CREATED AFTER LITIGATION ENDS.....	968
38.5	DUAL MEANING OF THE "PRIMARY PURPOSE" TEST.....	968
38.501	Introduction	968
38.502	Ambiguous Nature of the Work Product Rule.....	969
38.503	Continuing Ambiguity of "Primary Purpose" Test.....	969
38.6	LIMITING PROTECTION TO DOCUMENTS THAT AID IN LITIGATION	971
38.601	Introduction	971
38.602	<i>United States v. Textron, Inc.</i>	973
38.603	Narrow "Aid" or "Assist" Standard	974
38.604	Debate Over Protection for Non-Substantive Work Product.....	974

TABLE OF CONTENTS

38.7	DOCUMENTS CREATED TO SATISFY EXTERNAL REQUIREMENTS.....	974
38.8	DOCUMENTS CREATED TO SATISFY INTERNAL REQUIREMENTS.....	977
38.801	Introduction	977
38.802	Difference Between External and Internal Requirements.....	977
38.803	Difficulty of the Internal Requirement Issue	978
38.804	Unavailability of Protection for Internally Required Documents	978
38.805	Broader View	980
38.806	Parallel or Successive Actions	981
38.9	DOCUMENTS CREATED IN THE ORDINARY COURSE OF BUSINESS.....	981
38.901	Introduction	981
38.902	Defining “Ordinary Course of Business.”	982
38.903	General Rule	983
38.904	Government Documents	984
38.905	Corporate Documents.....	984
38.906	Relationship to External or Internal Requirements	988
38.907	Unprotected Post-Accident Documents	988
38.908	Protected Post-Accident Documents	990
38.10	COURTS’ REVIEW OF A DOCUMENT’S “FOUR CORNERS”	991
38.11	EXTRINSIC EVIDENCE SUCH AS AFFIDAVITS	992
38.12	PROTECTION FOR QUALITATIVELY DIFFERENT DOCUMENTS.....	993
38.13	“MORPHED” INVESTIGATIONS WITH CHANGING MOTIVATIONS	994
38.14	SEPARATE PARALLEL OR SUCCESSIVE INVESTIGATIONS	995
38.15	THE <i>ADLMAN</i> “BECAUSE OF” TEST	995
38.1501	Introduction	995
38.1502	Birth of the “Because of” Test.....	995
38.1503	Spread of the <i>Adlman</i> “Because of” Standard	996
38.1504	<i>Textron</i> and the Circuit Split.....	997
38.1505	Application of the <i>Adlman</i> “Because of” Standard.....	998
 CHAPTER 39: WORK PRODUCT CONTENT		
39.1	INTRODUCTION	1001
39.2	INTANGIBLE WORK PRODUCT.....	1001
39.201	Introduction	1001
39.202	Bases for the Debate	1001
39.203	Courts Protecting Intangible Work Product.....	1003

TABLE OF CONTENTS

39.204	Courts Declining to Protect Intangible Work Product.....	1007
39.205	Conclusion.....	1009
39.3	BACKGROUND FACTS ABOUT THE CREATION OF WORK PRODUCT.....	1009
39.301	Introduction	1009
39.302	Special Rules Providing Protection for Background Facts.....	1009
39.303	Courts Providing Fact Work Product Protection	1010
39.304	Courts Providing Opinion Work Product Protection	1010
39.305	Courts Declining to Protect Background Facts	1012
39.4	WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION FOR NON-SUBSTANTIVE DOCUMENTS	1013
39.401	Introduction	1013
39.402	Courts Protecting Non-Substantive Documents	1013
39.403	Courts Not Protecting Non-Substantive Documents	1015
39.404	Discovery Dilemma	1017
39.5	TYPES OF WORK PRODUCT	1018
39.501	Introduction	1018
39.502	Variety of Work Product Forms	1018
39.503	Debate About Work Product's Type Rather Than Content	1019
39.6	FIDUCIARY AND CRIME-FRAUD EXCEPTIONS	1021
CHAPTER 40: FACT WORK PRODUCT		
40.1	INTRODUCTION	1023
40.2	INTANGIBLE AND NON-SUBSTANTIVE WORK PRODUCT	1023
40.3	NAMING THE PROTECTION.....	1024
40.4	HISTORICAL FACTS IN THE WORK PRODUCT CONTEXT.....	1024
40.5	FACTS OBTAINED FROM OR GIVEN TO CLIENTS	1026
40.501	Introduction	1026
40.502	Facts That Clients Give to Their Lawyers	1026
40.503	Facts That Lawyers Give to Their Clients	1028
40.504	Facts That Lawyers Do Not Give to Their Clients.....	1028
40.505	Pre-Existing Documents That Clients Give to Their Lawyers.....	1029
40.506	Contemporaneous Documents Relaying Historical Facts	1030
40.507	Documents That Lawyers Give to Their Clients.....	1031
40.6	FACTS OBTAINED FROM OR GIVEN TO THIRD PARTIES	1031
40.601	Introduction	1031
40.602	Facts That Lawyers Obtain from Third Parties.....	1031
40.603	Facts That a Client's Lawyer Gives to Third Parties	1034
40.604	Documents That the Client's Lawyer Obtains from Third Parties	1034

TABLE OF CONTENTS

40.605	Documents That a Client's Lawyer Gives to Third Parties	1036
40.606	Documents That the Lawyer Obtains from Other Clients' Lawyers	1036
40.7	CONTEMPORANEOUS DOCUMENTS	1037
40.8	LAWYERS' COMMUNICATIONS WITH THIRD PARTIES	1038
40.9	EXAMPLES OF PROTECTED FACT WORK PRODUCT	1038
40.901	Introduction	1038
40.902	Level of Applicable Work Product Protection	1039
40.903	Materials That Can Deserve Work Product Protection	1039
40.904	Opinion Work Product and the <i>Sporck</i> Doctrine	1040
40.10	RETAINERS/FEE AGREEMENTS	1040
40.11	LAWYERS' BILLS	1041
40.12	WITNESS INTERVIEW NOTES AND SUMMARIES	1042
40.13	WITNESS STATEMENTS	1043
40.14	WITNESS AFFIDAVITS	1044
40.15	SURVEILLANCE VIDEOTAPES	1046
40.16	CORPORATIONS' LOSS RESERVE FIGURES	1047
40.17	OTHER EXAMPLES OF WORK PRODUCT	1049
40.1701	Introduction	1049
40.1702	Potentially Unprotected Material	1049
40.1703	Material That Deserves Fact Protection	1050
40.1704	Material That Might Deserve Opinion Protection	1051
40.1705	Other Examples of Protected Work Product	1053
40.18	DOCUMENTS NOT DESERVING WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION	1055
 CHAPTER 41: OPINION WORK PRODUCT		
41.1	INTRODUCTION	1057
41.2	COMPARISON TO THE OTHER PROTECTIONS	1058
41.3	ERRONEOUS LIMITATION OF PROTECTION	1059
41.4	PARTICIPANTS WHOSE OPINION CAN BE PROTECTED	1060
41.401	Introduction	1060
41.402	Lawyer-Created Opinion Work Product	1060
41.403	Nonlawyer Client Representatives' Opinion Work Product	1060
41.404	Parties' Opinion Work Product	1062

TABLE OF CONTENTS

41.5	DOCUMENTS CONTAINING OPINION	1063
41.501	Introduction	1063
41.502	Examples.....	1063
41.6	DOCUMENTS REFLECTING OPINION.....	1065
41.601	Introduction	1065
41.602	Witness Interview Notes, Statements, and Affidavits.....	1066
41.603	Other Examples.....	1070
41.604	Tactical Decision About Maximizing Protection	1073
41.7	INTANGIBLE OPINION WORK PRODUCT.....	1073
41.8	LAWYERS' COMMUNICATIONS WITH THIRD PARTIES.....	1075
CHAPTER 42: FACTS REFLECTING THE LAWYER'S OPINION		
42.1	INTRODUCTION	1079
42.2	INTRINSICALLY UNPROTECTED DOCUMENTS REFLECTING OPINION	1080
42.3	CLIENT REPRESENTATIVES.....	1081
42.4	HISTORY OF THE <i>SPORCK</i> DOCTRINE.....	1081
42.401	Introduction	1081
42.402	Attorney-Client Privilege.....	1081
42.403	History of the <i>Sporck</i> Doctrine	1082
42.404	Current Trends.....	1084
42.5	GENERAL RULES: INTRODUCTION	1084
42.6	EQUAL AVAILABILITY TO THE ADVERSARY	1085
42.7	SELECTION AS REFLECTING PROTECTED OPINION	1088
42.8	TIMING OF DISCLOSURE.....	1092
42.9	LAWYERS' SELECTION OF DOCUMENTS.....	1092
42.901	Introduction	1092
42.902	Selection of the Client's Documents.....	1092
42.903	Selection of the Adversary's Documents.....	1095
42.904	Selection of a Third Party's Documents.....	1098
42.905	Selection of Public Documents Including Case Law	1101
42.906	Documents That Support the Lawyers' Clients' Contentions	1103
42.907	Documents for Use at Deposition or Trial	1103
42.908	Privilege Logs	1104
42.10	LAWYERS' SELECTION OF WITNESSES	1104
42.1001	Introduction	1104
42.1002	Identity of Witnesses with Pertinent Knowledge	1104
42.1003	Identity of Confidential Witnesses.....	1105

TABLE OF CONTENTS

42.1004	Identity of Witnesses the Lawyer Selects to Interview	1105
42.1005	Identity of Witnesses the Lawyer Selects to Call at Trial	1108
42.1006	Questions Posed by Lawyers and Witness's Responses.....	1108
42.1007	Documents About Witness Interviews and Trial Preparation	1108
42.1008	Facts Obtained from Witnesses.....	1108
42.11	LAWYERS' SELECTION OF INFORMATION FOR DATABASES.....	1109
42.12	CONTENTION INTERROGATORIES AND RULE 30(b)(6) DEPOSITIONS	1111
42.1201	Introduction	1111
42.1202	Historical Facts	1111
42.1203	Contention Interrogatories: The Role of Timing	1111
42.1204	Rule 30(b)(6) Depositions	1111
42.13	OTHER EXAMPLES	1111
CHAPTER 43: PROTECTION FOR INTERNAL CORPORATE INVESTIGATIONS		
43.1	INTRODUCTION	1113
43.2	INTERNAL CORPORATE INVESTIGATIONS.....	1113
43.3	INITIATION OF THE INVESTIGATION	1114
43.301	Introduction	1114
43.302	Externally or Internally Required Investigations.....	1114
43.303	"Ordinary Course of Business" Investigations	1115
43.304	Investigations Undertaken in Extraordinary Circumstances.....	1117
43.305	Litigation as the Cause of the Investigation	1117
43.306	Qualitatively Different Type of Investigation	1118
43.307	Role of Lawyers in Initiating the Investigation	1119
43.308	"Initiating" Documents	1119
43.309	Other Sources of Proof Showing an Investigation's Initiation	1121
43.4	COURSE OF THE INVESTIGATION	1123
43.401	Introduction	1123
43.402	Role of Lawyers	1123
43.403	Process Used and Documents Generated	1124
43.404	Investigation Report.....	1125
43.5	USE OF THE INVESTIGATION	1125
43.6	"MORPHED" INVESTIGATIONS WITH CHANGING MOTIVATIONS...	1126
43.7	SEPARATE OR SUCCESSIVE INTERNAL INVESTIGATIONS	1128
43.701	Introduction	1128
43.702	Parallel Investigations	1128
43.703	Successive Investigations	1130

TABLE OF CONTENTS

43.8	EXAMPLES OF INTERNAL CORPORATE INVESTIGATIONS	1131
43.801	Introduction	1131
43.802	Investigations Deserving Work Product Protection.....	1131
43.803	Investigations Not Deserving Work Product Protection	1134
43.9	WAIVER IN THE INVESTIGATION CONTEXT	1136
43.10	INSURANCE CONTEXT: INTRODUCTION.....	1136
43.11	FIRST- AND THIRD-PARTY INSURANCE CONTEXTS.....	1137
43.12	FIRST-PARTY INSURANCE CONTEXT	1138
43.1201	Introduction	1138
43.1202	Key Date in Asserting Work Product Protection	1138
43.1203	Insureds' Bad Faith Claims Against the Companies.....	1141
43.13	THIRD-PARTY INSURANCE CONTEXT.....	1142
43.1301	Introduction	1142
43.1302	Courts' Approaches to Work Product Protection.....	1142
43.1303	Third Parties' Bad Faith Claim Against Companies	1143
43.1304	Insureds' Bad Faith Claims Against Insurance Companies	1144
43.1305	Other Situations.....	1144
 CHAPTER 44: OVERCOMING WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION		
44.1	INTRODUCTION	1147
44.2	COMPARISON WITH THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE	1147
44.3	DURATION OF THE PROTECTION	1149
44.301	Introduction	1149
44.302	Courts' Disagreement About the Protection's Duration	1149
44.303	Civil Work Product Sought in an Unrelated Civil Case	1150
44.304	Civil Work Product Sought in a Related Civil Case.....	1151
44.305	Criminal Work Product Sought in a Later Civil Case	1152
44.4	OVERCOMING PROTECTION FOR STATEMENTS.....	1154
44.5	FEDERAL RULE OF EVIDENCE 612.....	1155
44.501	Introduction	1155
44.502	General Rule	1156
44.503	Application of Rule 612.....	1157
44.504	Rule 612 Differences with Attorney-Client Privilege	1158
44.505	State Evidence Rules	1161
44.6	EXCULPATORY EVIDENCE IN A CRIMINAL CASE.....	1161
44.7	APPLICATION OF THE FIDUCIARY EXCEPTION.....	1162
44.701	Introduction	1162
44.702	Fiduciary Exception Applied to Work Product.....	1162
44.703	Fiduciary Exception Not Applied to Work Product.....	1162

TABLE OF CONTENTS

44.8	APPLICATION OF THE CRIME-FRAUD EXCEPTION	1164
44.801	Introduction	1164
44.802	Similarities to Applicability in the Privilege Context.....	1164
44.803	Differences from Applicability in the Privilege Context.....	1165
44.804	Application to Opinion Work Product.....	1166
44.9	WRONGFULLY CREATED FACT WORK PRODUCT.....	1167
44.10	OVERCOMING PROTECTION FOR NON-TESTIFYING EXPERTS.....	1168
44.1001	Introduction	1168
44.1002	“Exceptional Circumstances” Standard.....	1168
44.1003	Application to a Non-Testifying Expert’s Identity	1168
44.1004	Application to a Non-Testifying Expert’s Facts and Opinions.....	1168
44.1005	Waiver Impact of Disclosure to or by Non-Testifying Experts.....	1171
44.11	OVERCOMING PROTECTION APPLICABLE TO TESTIFYING EXPERTS	1171
44.12	PROCEDURAL ISSUES.....	1172
44.1201	Introduction	1172
44.1202	Multiple Chances to Overcome Protection	1172
44.1203	Redaction	1173
44.1204	Cost Shifting	1175
44.1205	Other Procedural Issues	1176
 CHAPTER 45: OVERCOMING FACT WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION		
45.1	INTRODUCTION	1177
45.2	COMPARISON WITH THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE AND GENERAL RULES	1177
45.201	Introduction	1177
45.202	Comparison with the Attorney-Client Privilege.....	1177
45.203	Federal Rule	1177
45.204	General Rules	1179
45.3	“SUBSTANTIAL NEED” FACTOR.....	1179
45.301	Introduction	1179
45.302	Relationship Between “Substantial Need” and Other Factors.....	1179
45.303	Courts’ Confusion about the “Substantial Need” Factor	1180
45.304	Courts’ Approach to the “Substantial Need” Factor	1180
45.305	Meeting the “Substantial Need” Standard	1182
45.306	Applying the “Substantial Need” Factor: Impeachment	1183
45.307	Circumstances Satisfying the “Substantial Need” Factor	1186
45.308	Circumstances Not Satisfying the “Substantial Need” Factor.....	1187
45.4	“SUBSTANTIAL EQUIVALENT” FACTOR	1189
45.401	Introduction	1189
45.402	Relationship Between “Substantial Equivalent” and Other Factors.....	1189

TABLE OF CONTENTS

45.403	Different Sources of Information.....	1189
45.404	Contemporaneous Memorializations	1190
45.405	Courts' Analysis of Contemporaneous Records	1192
45.406	Availability of Other Evidence Sources	1195
45.5	"UNDUE HARDSHIP" FACTOR	1196
45.501	Introduction	1196
45.502	Relationship Between the "Undue Hardship" and Other Factors.....	1196
45.503	Improper Application of "Undue Hardship" Factor	1196
45.504	Meaning of the Phrase "Undue Hardship."	1197
45.505	Application of the "Undue Hardship" Standard: Witnesses.....	1199
45.506	Application of the "Undue Hardship" Standard: Documents.....	1204
45.6	APPLICATION TO DATABASES	1207
45.7	APPLICATION TO SURVEILLANCE VIDEOTAPES	1208
45.8	WITHHOLDING LITIGANT'S BURDEN OF PRODUCING DOCUMENTS	1211
45.9	ROLE OF THE ADVERSARY'S DILIGENCE	1212
CHAPTER 46: OVERCOMING OPINION WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION		
46.1	INTRODUCTION	1215
46.2	FEDERAL AND STATE RULES.....	1215
46.3	DEGREE OF PROTECTION.....	1215
46.301	Introduction	1215
46.302	Absolute Protection	1216
46.303	"Almost Absolute" Protection	1216
46.304	High Degree of Protection.....	1217
46.305	Lesser Degree of Protection	1217
46.306	Other Approaches.....	1218
46.4	APPLICATION OF THE PROTECTION.....	1219
46.5	FEDERAL RULE OF EVIDENCE 612.....	1219
CHAPTER 47: POWER TO WAIVE WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION		
47.1	INTRODUCTION	1221
47.2	CLIENTS' AND LAWYERS' ABILITY TO WAIVE PROTECTION	1221
47.201	Introduction	1221
47.202	Clients' Power to Waive	1221
47.203	Waiver by Lawyers.....	1221
47.204	Conflicts Between Clients and Lawyers About Waiver	1222
47.205	Lawyers Withholding Work Product from Clients.....	1223

TABLE OF CONTENTS

47.3	THIRD PARTIES' POWER TO WAIVE PROTECTION	1223
47.301	Introduction	1223
47.302	Third-Party Disclosure of Work Product	1223
47.303	Effect of a Confidentiality Agreement	1225
47.4	SIMILARITIES TO THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE.....	1225
47.401	Introduction	1225
47.402	No Waiver for Compelled Disclosure	1226
47.403	No Automatic Waiver in Other Cases.....	1226
47.404	Disclaiming Does Not Avoid a Waiver	1226
47.405	Not Objecting to Production Can Waive Protection.....	1226
47.406	Disclosing Facts Does Not Waive Protection.....	1226
47.407	Actual Disclosure Waives Protection	1227
47.408	Disclosing the "Gist" Waives Protection	1227
47.409	Disclosure to an Adversary Waives Protection	1228
47.410	Disclosure to One Adversary Waives Protection to All Other Adversaries	1228
47.5	DIFFERENCES FROM THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE.....	1228
47.501	Introduction	1228
47.502	Protection Survives Non-Adverse Third-Party Presence	1229
47.503	No Automatic Waiver From Disclosure	1229
47.504	Assessing Whether the Recipient Is Adverse	1231
47.505	Changing Roles of Recipients of Disclosed Work Product	1232
47.506	Effect of Disclosing Work Product.....	1233
47.507	Confidentiality Agreements or Understandings	1234
47.508	Joint Defense/Common Interest Agreements.....	1234
 CHAPTER 48: INTENTIONAL, INADVERTENT, OR IMPLIED WAIVER		
48.1	INTRODUCTION	1235
48.2	INTENTIONAL DISCLOSURE IN THE CORPORATE CONTEXT	1236
48.201	Introduction	1236
48.202	Disclosure Within Corporations and Corporate Families	1236
48.203	Disclosure to Corporate Agents/Consultants	1237
48.204	Disclosure to Auditors	1238
48.205	Disclosure to Other Third Parties in the Corporate Setting	1240
48.206	Disclosure in Merger Negotiations.....	1242
48.3	INTENTIONAL DISCLOSURE TO THE GOVERNMENT	1244
48.301	Introduction	1244
48.302	Federal Statutes and Regulations Preventing Waiver	1244
48.303	Federal Rule of Evidence 502	1244
48.304	Disclosure of Facts to the Government.....	1244
48.305	Public Policy Debate.....	1245
48.306	Majority View: Disclosure to the Government Waives the Protection	1246
48.307	Effect of a Confidentiality Agreement	1246
48.308	Disclosure Pursuant to a Confidentiality Agreement.....	1248

TABLE OF CONTENTS

48.309	Disclosure Waiving Fact but Not Opinion Protection.....	1249
48.310	Disclosure to the Government as an Ally	1250
48.311	Disclosure to Induce Governmental Action Against Corporate Adversary	1251
48.312	Subsequent Disclosure by the Government.....	1252
48.4	INTENTIONAL DISCLOSURE TO OTHER THIRD PARTIES.....	1252
48.401	Introduction	1252
48.402	Disclosure to the Public	1252
48.403	Disclosure to Adversaries	1253
48.404	Disclosure to Unfriendly Third Parties	1254
48.405	Disclosure to Neutral Third Parties.....	1255
48.406	Disclosure During Settlement Negotiations.....	1256
48.407	Disclosure Within a Family	1257
48.408	Disclosure to Other Third Parties	1258
48.5	IMPORTANCE OF CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENTS	1260
48.501	Introduction	1260
48.502	Disclosure to Third Parties Pursuant to a Confidentiality Agreement	1260
48.503	Disclosure to Third Parties with a Pre-Existing Duty of Confidentiality	1260
48.504	Effect of a Third Party's Breach of a Confidentiality Agreement.....	1261
48.6	ROLE OF THE COMMON INTEREST DOCTRINE.....	1262
48.601	Introduction	1262
48.602	Common Interest Terminology and Protection	1262
48.603	Inapplicability of the Common Interest Doctrine	1264
48.7	WAIVER OF PRIVILEGE BUT NOT WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION.	1266
48.8	EFFECT OF RULE 502 ON INTENTIONAL EXPRESS WAIVER.....	1268
48.9	INADVERTENT EXPRESS WAIVER	1268
48.10	IMPLIED WAIVER	1268
48.11	"AT ISSUE" DOCTRINE.....	1271
CHAPTER 49: DISCLOSURE OF WORK PRODUCT TO AND BY EXPERTS		
49.1	INTRODUCTION	1275
49.2	DISCLOSURE TO NON-TESTIFYING EXPERTS	1275
49.3	DISCLOSURE BY NON-TESTIFYING EXPERTS	1276
49.301	Introduction	1276
49.302	Disclosure by Non-Testifying Experts to Testifying Experts	1276
49.303	Reliance on Non-Testifying Experts' Opinions.....	1277
49.304	Disclosure by Non-Testifying Experts to Others.....	1277

TABLE OF CONTENTS

49.4	NON-TESTIFYING EXPERTS PLAYING MULTIPLE ROLES	1279
49.5	TESTIFYING EXPERTS' DOCUMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS.....	1279
49.6	FACT WORK PRODUCT DISCLOSED TO TESTIFYING EXPERTS	1279
49.7	OPINION WORK PRODUCT DISCLOSED TO TESTIFYING EXPERTS	1280
49.701	Introduction	1280
49.702	Pre-1993 Standard	1280
49.703	Post-1993 Standard in Federal Courts	1281
49.704	Why the Protection Should Apply: Bright-Line Test	1282
49.705	Minority View Rejecting the Bright-Line Test	1283
49.706	Federal Rules Changes in 2010.....	1283
49.707	Protection in State Courts	1284
49.8	TESTIFYING EXPERTS WITH MULTIPLE ROLES IN THE SAME CASE	1284
49.9	TESTIFYING EXPERTS WITH MULTIPLE ROLES IN DIFFERENT CASES.....	1286
49.10	SCOPE OF WAIVER.....	1288
CHAPTER 50: SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER: APPLICABILITY AND SCOPE		
50.1	INTRODUCTION	1291
50.2	COMPARISON TO THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE	1291
50.3	WAIVER OF THE PRIVILEGE BUT NOT WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION	1294
50.4	SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER IN THE WORK PRODUCT CONTEXT.....	1295
50.401	Introduction	1295
50.402	Federal Rule of Evidence 502	1295
50.403	Context of the Disclosure	1296
50.404	Work Product Not Shared with the Client	1297
50.5	EXAMPLES OF SUBJECT MATTER WAIVER	1298
50.501	Introduction	1298
50.502	Intentional Express Waiver.....	1298
50.503	Implied Waiver	1300
50.6	SCOPE OF WAIVER.....	1300
50.7	WAIVER OF FACT BUT NOT OPINION PROTECTION	1303
50.8	THE FARAGHER/ELLERTH DOCTRINE	1306

TABLE OF CONTENTS

50.9	APPLICATION IN THE PATENT CONTEXT	1308
50.901	Introduction	1308
50.902	Work Product Not Shared with the Client	1309
50.903	Communication with Lawyers Playing Different Roles	1310
50.904	Temporal Scope of the Waiver	1310
CHAPTER 51: ASSERTING AND LITIGATING THE PROTECTIONS		1311
CHAPTER 52: SOURCE AND CHOICE OF ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE LAW		
52.1	INTRODUCTION	1315
52.2	ADDRESSING ONLY ONE TYPE OF PROTECTION	1316
52.3	CHOICE OF PRIVILEGE LAW	1317
52.301	Introduction	1317
52.302	Courts' Analyses in Avoiding a Choice of Law	1317
52.303	Transactional Parties' Power to Choose Governing Law.....	1319
52.4	SOURCE OF PRIVILEGE LAW.....	1320
52.401	Introduction	1320
52.402	Privilege Does Not Rest on Constitutional Principles	1320
52.403	Federal Common Law	1320
52.404	State Privilege Law	1321
52.405	Federal and State Courts Considering Other's Approach	1323
52.5	CHOICE OF PRIVILEGE LAW IN STATE COURTS.....	1325
52.6	CHOICE OF PRIVILEGE LAW IN FEDERAL COURTS	1326
52.601	Introduction	1326
52.602	Federal Question Cases	1326
52.603	Pendent State Claims	1327
52.604	Patent Cases	1327
52.605	Diversity Cases.....	1328
52.606	Determining Whether Federal or State Law Applies to Specific Issues.....	1329
52.607	Multidistrict Litigation	1330
52.608	Federal Rule of Evidence 502	1331
52.7	CHOICE OF PRIVILEGE LAW IN FEDERAL DIVERSITY CASES	1331
52.701	Introduction	1331
52.702	Apparent Short-Circuiting of the Choice of Law Analysis	1331
52.703	Courts Applying Host State's Choice of Law Analysis	1332
52.704	Courts' Selection of Applicable State Privilege Law	1333
52.705	Transactional Parties' Power to Choose Governing Law.....	1336
52.706	Conclusion.....	1338

TABLE OF CONTENTS

52.8	FOREIGN COMMUNICATIONS AND PRIVILEGE LAW	1339
52.801	Introduction	1339
52.802	Application of Foreign Privilege Law	1339
52.803	Jurisdiction with the Predominant Interest	1340
52.804	Communications That Do Not “Touch Base” with the United States	1342
52.805	Establishing the Applicable Foreign Law	1344
52.806	Significance for In-House Lawyers	1345
52.807	Conclusion	1346
52.9	CHOICE OF PRIVILEGE LAW IN ARBITRATIONS	1346
 CHAPTER 53: SOURCE AND CHOICE OF WORK PRODUCT LAW		
53.1	INTRODUCTION	1349
53.2	ADDRESSING ONLY ONE TYPE OF PROTECTION	1349
53.3	SOURCE OF WORK PRODUCT LAW—STATE COURTS	1349
53.301	Introduction	1349
53.302	Variations Among States’ Work Product Principles	1349
53.303	State Courts Looking to Federal Principles for Guidance	1351
53.4	SOURCE OF WORK PRODUCT LAW—FEDERAL COURTS	1351
53.401	Introduction	1351
53.402	Parallel Common Law and Federal Rules Provisions	1352
53.403	Federal Question and Diversity Cases	1352
53.404	Federal Courts Looking to State Principles for Guidance	1352
53.5	VARIATIONS IN WORK PRODUCT LAW—FEDERAL COURTS	1353
53.501	Introduction	1353
53.502	Variations Among Federal Courts	1353
53.503	Significance of the Variation	1354
53.6	CHOICE OF WORK PRODUCT LAW	1355
53.601	Introduction	1355
53.602	State Courts	1355
53.603	Federal Courts	1355
 CHAPTER 54: ASSERTING THE PROTECTIONS		
54.1	INTRODUCTION	1357
54.2	HORIZONTAL SCOPE OF LITIGANT’S DUTY	1357
54.201	Introduction	1357
54.202	General Rules	1357
54.203	Litigants’ Current Lawyer	1358
54.204	Litigants’ Former Lawyer	1358
54.205	Government Seizure of Protected Documents	1360

TABLE OF CONTENTS

54.3	TEMPORAL SCOPE OF LITIGANT'S DUTY.....	1360
54.4	DUTY TO OBJECT: TIMING.....	1363
54.5	DUTY TO OBJECT: SPECIFICITY.....	1364
54.501	Introduction.....	1364
54.502	General Rule.....	1365
54.503	"Subject to" or "To The Extent That" Privilege Objections.....	1365
54.504	Meaning of the "Specificity" Requirement.....	1366
54.505	Circumstances Justifying a Less Specific Objection.....	1367
54.6	REDACTION.....	1367
54.601	Introduction.....	1367
54.602	Redaction Rule.....	1368
54.603	Inadequate Protection from Redaction.....	1368
54.604	Litigants' Failure to Redact All Unprotected Communications....	1369
54.605	Redaction of Work Product.....	1369
54.7	EFFECT OF PARTY'S FAILURE TO OBJECT.....	1370
CHAPTER 55: PRIVILEGE LOGS		
55.1	INTRODUCTION.....	1373
55.2	FEDERAL AND STATE RULES.....	1374
55.201	Introduction.....	1374
55.202	Fed. R. Civ. P. 26.....	1374
55.203	Fed. R. Civ. P. 33.....	1375
55.204	Fed. R. Civ. P. 34.....	1376
55.205	Fed. R. Civ. P. 45.....	1377
55.206	Other Rules.....	1378
55.3	TIMING OF PRIVILEGE LOGS.....	1378
55.4	REQUIRED DETAILS ABOUT WITHHELD DOCUMENTS.....	1379
55.401	Introduction.....	1379
55.402	General Requirements for Log Entries.....	1379
55.403	Articulate the Basis of the Claimed Protection.....	1380
55.404	Identify a Document's Author.....	1381
55.405	Identify a Document's Recipient.....	1381
55.406	Identify Recipients Not Listed on the Documents.....	1383
55.407	Identify Recipients of Withheld Documents' Content.....	1383
55.408	Additional Log Information for Work Product.....	1384
55.409	Other Data.....	1385
55.410	Requirement to Log Protected Metadata.....	1386
55.411	Other Log Requirements.....	1387
55.5	LOGGING ATTACHMENTS AND EMAIL.....	1387
55.501	Introduction.....	1387
55.502	Protected Portions of a Single Document and Marginal Notes.....	1387

TABLE OF CONTENTS

55.503	Attachments	1388
55.504	Logging Email Strings	1389
55.505	Conclusion.....	1392
55.6	REQUIRED DETAILS ABOUT WITHHELD ORAL COMMUNICATIONS.....	1393
55.7	CIRCUMSTANCES JUSTIFYING A LESS SPECIFIC LOG	1394
55.701	Introduction	1394
55.702	Federal Rule Provision Justifying a Less Specific Log	1394
55.703	Justification for Not Logging Certain Documents	1395
55.704	Logging by Category.....	1396
55.705	Transmittal Communications	1397
55.706	Application of the <i>Sporck</i> Doctrine	1398
55.8	COURTS' TREATMENT OF PARTICULAR LOG PHRASES.....	1399
55.801	Introduction	1399
55.802	Boilerplate Entries	1400
55.803	Court-Approved Privilege Logs	1400
55.804	Log Entries Criticized by Courts.....	1401
55.805	Attorney-Client Privilege Claims.....	1402
55.806	Work Product Log Entries Criticized by Courts.....	1405
55.9	CHALLENGING A WITHHOLDING LITIGANT'S PRIVILEGE LOG	1405
55.10	LITIGANT'S FAILURE TO PROPERLY LOG WITHHELD DOCUMENTS	1406
55.1001	Introduction	1406
55.1002	Privilege Logs Do Not Have to Be Perfect	1406
55.1003	Effect of Federal Rules.....	1407
55.1004	Pointing to the Other Side's Privilege Log	1408
55.1005	Range of Possible Judicial Responses	1409
55.1006	<i>In Camera</i> Review	1409
55.1007	Allowing Litigants to File a Tardy Privilege Log.....	1410
55.1008	Declining to Find a Waiver Based on Inadequate Log	1410
55.1009	Allowing Litigants to Amend an Inadequate Log	1412
55.1010	Imposing Some Sanctions Short of Waiver.....	1413
55.1011	Ordering Production of Withheld Documents	1414
55.11	CORRECTING PRIVILEGE LOGS	1417
55.12	RISK OF PROVIDING TOO MUCH INFORMATION	1419
55.13	PRACTICAL TIPS AND SUGGESTED LANGUAGE	1419
55.1301	Introduction	1419
55.1302	General Approach.....	1419
55.1303	Attorney-Client Privilege Log Entries	1420
55.1304	Work Product Doctrine Log Entries.....	1421

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 56: EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT

56.1	INTRODUCTION	1423
56.2	TIMING OF REQUIREMENT FOR EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT	1423
56.201	Introduction	1423
56.202	When Adversary Challenges a Protection Claim	1424
56.203	Requiring Evidentiary Support at an Earlier Time	1425
56.3	FOCUS ON THE FOUR CORNERS OF WITHHELD DOCUMENTS	1425
56.4	GENERAL RULE REQUIRING EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT	1425
56.5	SPECIFIC ASSERTIONS REQUIRING EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT	1427
56.6	LAWYER REPRESENTATIONS	1431
56.7	LEGAL MEMORANDA	1432
56.8	AFFIDAVITS AND SIMILAR EVIDENCE	1432
56.9	EFFECT OF FAILURE TO PROVIDE EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT	1434

CHAPTER 57: LITIGATING THE PROTECTIONS

57.1	INTRODUCTION	1437
57.2	STANDING	1437
57.3	ADVERSE INFERENCE	1440
57.4	NARROWNESS OF THE PROTECTIONS	1442
57.5	PRESUMPTIONS	1442
57.501	Introduction	1442
57.502	Courts Recognizing Presumptions	1443
57.503	Presumptions Involving In-House Lawyers	1444
57.504	Courts Not Recognizing Presumptions	1444
57.6	RELATIONSHIP TO WAIVER	1445
57.601	Introduction	1445
57.602	Relationship to Express Waiver Doctrine	1445
57.603	Relationship to Implied Waiver Doctrine	1445
57.7	BURDEN OF PROOF: PRIVILEGE	1446
57.701	Introduction	1446
57.702	General Rule	1446
57.703	Types of Burden	1447
57.704	Burden of Proving Waiver	1448
57.705	Burden of Proving Other Elements	1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

57.8	BURDEN OF PROOF: WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE.....	1450
57.801	Introduction	1450
57.802	General Rule	1450
57.803	Type of Burden	1451
57.804	Burden of Proving Waiver	1451
57.805	Adversary's Burden to Overcome Work Product Protection	1452
57.9	EFFECT OF PRIVILEGE HEADERS AND STAMPS	1454
57.901	Introduction	1454
57.902	Effect in Determining Privilege or Work Product Protection.....	1454
57.903	Effect in Other Contexts	1456
57.904	Conclusion.....	1458
 CHAPTER 58: OTHER DISCOVERY ISSUES		
58.1	INTRODUCTION	1461
58.2	CONTENTION INTERROGATORIES	1461
58.201	Introduction	1461
58.202	General Rule	1461
58.203	Timing	1463
58.3	RULE 30(b)(6) DEPOSITIONS	1465
58.301	Introduction	1465
58.302	Timing	1466
58.303	Precluding Rule 30(b)(6) Depositions.....	1466
58.304	Waiver Implications	1468
58.305	Documents Reviewed by Rule 30(b)(6) Witnesses.....	1469
58.306	Privilege and Work Product Objections.....	1471
58.4	DEPOSING LAWYERS	1478
58.401	Introduction	1478
58.402	Reasons for Restricting Discovery of Other Lawyers	1478
58.403	<i>Shelton v. American Motors Corp.</i> Standard	1478
58.404	Other Restrictive Standards.....	1479
58.405	Standard for Lawyer Discovery.....	1480
58.406	Lawyers Covered by Restrictive Standards.....	1480
58.407	Applying <i>Shelton</i> and Other Restrictive Standards	1482
58.408	Limiting the Type of Discovery of Another Lawyer	1484
58.5	DISCOVERY ABOUT DISCOVERY	1485
58.501	Introduction	1485
58.502	Discovery About Document Discovery	1486
58.503	Discovery About Interrogatory Answers.....	1495
58.504	Discovery About Witnesses.....	1497

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 59: COURTS' ROLE

59.1	INTRODUCTION	1499
59.2	BIFURCATION OF PATENT AND OTHER CASES	1499
59.201	Introduction	1499
59.202	Bifurcation of Patent Cases	1499
59.203	Bifurcation of Non-Patent Cases	1500
59.3	WHO SHOULD DECIDE PRIVILEGE/WORK PRODUCT ISSUES	1500
59.301	Introduction	1500
59.302	Which Judge Should Decide Protection Issues	1501
59.303	Special Masters or Referees	1502
59.4	IN CAMERA REVIEW	1503
59.401	Introduction	1503
59.402	Courts Declining to Conduct an <i>In Camera</i> Review	1504
59.403	Courts Conducting an <i>In Camera</i> Review	1508
59.404	Courts Conducting an <i>In Camera</i> Review for Crime-Fraud Exception Claim	1511
59.405	<i>In Camera</i> Review Process	1511
59.5	COURTS' QUESTIONABLE PROCEDURES	1512
59.6	OTHER PROCEDURAL ISSUES	1513
59.7	TRIAL COURTS' DUTY TO PREPARE FOR APPELLATE REVIEW	1514

CHAPTER 60: APPELLATE REVIEW

60.1	INTRODUCTION	1515
60.2	PREPARING FOR AN APPEAL	1515
60.201	Assuring a Full Factual Record	1515
60.202	Preserving Protections Pending an Appeal	1515
60.3	INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS IN FEDERAL COURTS	1516
60.301	Introduction	1516
60.302	Certification of an Interlocutory Appeal	1517
60.303	Appeal of Contempt Order	1517
60.304	Collateral Order Doctrine	1517
60.305	The <i>Perlman</i> Doctrine	1519
60.306	Mandamus	1521
60.307	Other Grounds in Interlocutory Appeal	1521
60.308	Conclusion	1522
60.4	INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS IN STATE COURTS	1522
60.5	APPELLATE STANDARD OF REVIEW IN FEDERAL COURTS	1523
60.501	Introduction	1523
60.502	General Rule	1523

TABLE OF CONTENTS

60.503	Issues Reviewed de Novo	1523
60.504	Issues Reviewed Under a “Clearly Erroneous” Standard.....	1525
60.505	Issues Reviewed Under an “Abuse of Discretion” Standard	1527
60.6	APPELLATE STANDARD OF REVIEW IN STATE COURTS	1529
60.601	Introduction	1529
60.602	General Rule.....	1530
60.603	Issues Reviewed de Novo	1530
60.604	Issues Reviewed Under a “Clearly Erroneous” Standard.....	1530
60.605	Issues Reviewed Under an “Abuse of Discretion” Standard	1531
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....		1533
INDEX		I-1

CHAPTER 2

ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE: INTRODUCTION AND BASIC PRINCIPLES

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The attorney client privilege enjoys a unique status among all legal doctrines. For many reasons, it stands alone as the most important subject that lawyers must understand.

Lawyers deal with attorney-client privilege issues whenever they communicate with clients, would-be clients, clients' agents, their own agents, and even third parties. In today's world of balancing tests and legal nuances, the privilege remains a stark reminder that the law can be absolute—a properly created attorney-client privilege provides complete confidentiality and lasts forever.

The attorney-client privilege pervades every aspect of what lawyers do. Lawyers must understand it to help their clients create a viable privilege and avoid losing the privilege by improperly disclosing confidential information. Without this awareness, a lawyer may inadvertently destroy the privilege through inattention or neglect.

By contrast, dramatically different rules control the work product doctrine. Failing to appreciate work product doctrine principles can involve even higher stakes because, by definition, this doctrine involves litigation or anticipated litigation.

Even some courts seem confused by these doctrines, and some judicial decisions misunderstand or misapply the attorney-client privilege.¹ This book seeks to clarify these misunderstandings and provide the practitioner with guidance in this critical area of the law.

2.2 ETHICS DUTY OF CONFIDENTIALITY CONTRASTED

Some lawyers mistakenly equate the attorney-client privilege with the ethics duty of confidentiality. Although this book does not devote much attention to the ethics duty, it is worth noting the vast differences between these two legal principles.

The attorney-client privilege is an evidentiary rule that protects certain communications from a third party's efforts to discover the substance of those

¹ The courts cannot even agree about the level of difficulty in applying the privilege. In decisions issued during the same year, one federal court decision explained that the attorney-client privilege law "is fairly straightforward," *Bowen v. Parking Auth. of the City of Camden*, Civ. A. No. 00-5765 (JBS), 2002 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 14585, at *12 (D.N.J. July 30, 2002), while another federal decision admitted that the attorney-client privilege "is often litigated and little understood." *Bank Brussels Lambert v. Credit Lyonnais (Suisse), S.A.*, 210 F.R.D. 506, 508 (S.D.N.Y. 2002).

communications. The ethics duty of confidentiality provides a broader protection. It differs from the privilege in its source, nature, scope, and application.

First, the ethics duty comes from each jurisdiction's ethics rules. Their violation can result in the punishment of lawyers. Second, the ethics duty is not limited to evidentiary concerns that arise only when a third party seeks to learn the substance of protected communications. Instead, the ethics duty guides lawyers' conduct at all times, even if no third party ever seeks to discover protected information or communications.

Third, the ethics duty of confidentiality extends far beyond what is protected by the attorney-client privilege. Most states follow the ABA Model Rules of Professional Conduct in prohibiting lawyers from revealing "information relating to the representation of a client" absent some countervailing duty.²

A comment to ABA Model Rule 1.6(a) explains the relationship between the ethics duty of confidentiality and the attorney-client privilege:

The principle of client-lawyer confidentiality is given effect by related bodies of law: the attorney-client privilege, the work product doctrine and the rule of confidentiality established in professional ethics. The attorney-client privilege and work-product doctrine apply in judicial and other proceedings in which a lawyer may be called as a witness or otherwise required to produce evidence concerning a client. The rule of client-lawyer confidentiality applies in situations other than those where evidence is sought from the lawyer through compulsion of law. The confidentiality rule, for example, applies not only to matters communicated in confidence by the client but also to all information relating to the representation, whatever its source. A lawyer may not disclose such information except as authorized or required by the Rules of Professional Conduct or other law.³

An example might illustrate the practical significance of this difference. Information available in the public record, such as a client's arrest 20 years ago on drunk driving charges, could never be protected by the attorney-client privilege. However, such information presumably would fall within the scope of a lawyer's ethics duty of confidentiality if the lawyer has learned it while representing the client. Similarly, information about a client that the client's lawyer obtains from third parties would not generally be protected by the privilege but would be covered by the ethics duty of confidentiality.

² ABA Model Rule 1.6.

The previous ABA Model Code followed a different approach, requiring lawyers to preserve the confidentiality only of "confidences" and "secrets." The old ABA Model Code defined a "confidence" as "information protected by the attorney-client privilege under applicable law," and defined a "secret" as "other information gained in the professional relationship that the client has requested be held inviolate or the disclosure of which would be embarrassing or would be likely to be detrimental to the client." ABA Model Code DR 4-101(A).

³ ABA Model Rule 1.6 cmt. [3].

Lawyers might find themselves dealing with this critical distinction in a number of contexts. For instance, the ethics duty of confidentiality covers such information as a client's identity, fees that the client has paid the lawyer, the date and time of a meeting with the client, etc. The privilege rarely if ever protects such information (or even communications containing such information). Yet a lawyer asked for such non-privileged information must refuse to provide it. This fulfills the lawyer's duty of confidentiality. Even lawyers responding to discovery seeking such information generally must resist the discovery, unless doing so would be frivolous. As one court explained

There is some overlap between the ethical duty of confidentiality and the attorney-client privilege. By definition, all communications protected by the attorney-client privilege will be confidential and covered by the ethical duty. . . . That overlap is the reason why the ethical duty of confidentiality requires an attorney to invoke the attorney-client privilege when it is applicable.⁴

2.3 SOCIETAL BENEFITS AND COSTS OF THE PRIVILEGE

2.301 Introduction. From the very beginning, the attorney-client privilege has reflected a precarious balance between competing interests. That balance pervades both the principles underlying the attorney-client privilege and its application in specific cases.

2.302 Genesis. In 2007, the Federal Court of Claims traced the attorney-client privilege back to Roman times, when Cicero refrained from seeking to learn the substance of communications between a Sicilian governor being investigated for corruption and the governor's lawyer.⁵ Other courts have pointed to the development of the attorney-client privilege during Elizabethan times.⁶ Either way, the attorney-client privilege represents one of the common law's oldest protections from disclosure.⁷ This contrasts sharply with the work product doctrine, which is only about 60 years old.⁸

Interestingly, the attorney-client privilege never developed into a constitutional right in the United States, despite its importance.⁹

⁴ *State v. Gonzalez*, 234 P.3d 1, 11 (Kan. 2010).

⁵ *Evergreen Trading, LLC v. United States*, 80 Fed. Cl. 122, 128 n.6 (Fed. Cl. 2007).

⁶ *United States v. (Under Seal) (In re Grand Jury 83-2 John Doe No. 462)*, 748 F.2d 871, 873 (4th Cir. 1984).

⁷ *Chase v. NOVA Se. Univ., Inc.*, Case No. 11-61290-CIV-COHN/SELTZER, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 83815, at *7 (S.D. Fla. June 18, 2012) ("The attorney-client privilege is the oldest of the privileges protecting confidential information."); *United States v. Jicarilla Apache Nation*, 131 S. Ct. 2313, 2318 (2011) ("The attorney-client privilege ranks among the oldest and most established evidentiary privileges known to our law.").

⁸ Chapter 33 of this book discusses that issue.

⁹ Chapter 52 of this book discusses that issue.

2.303 Societal Benefits of the Privilege. As originally envisioned and still applied, the attorney-client privilege rests on the societal interest in encouraging clients to provide full and honest information to their lawyers. Society benefits by protecting these communications from clients to lawyers because lawyers help guide their clients' conduct in lawful directions and help resolve disputes.

The First Circuit articulated this purpose in 2011. "The rationale that undergirds the privilege is easily understood: treating communications between lawyer and client as confidential encourages full and frank disclosure that better enables the lawyer to represent the client and better enables the client to conform his conduct to the law."¹⁰ Other courts have articulated this important societal purpose.¹¹

The *Restatement* provides a more extensive discussion of the privilege's underlying rationale:

[C]onfidentiality enhances the value of client-lawyer communications and hence the efficacy of legal services. The rationale is founded on three related assumptions. First, vindicating rights and complying with obligations under the law and under modern legal processes are matters often too complex and uncertain for a person untrained in the law, so that clients need to consult lawyers. The second assumption is that a client who consults a lawyer needs to disclose all of the facts to the lawyer and must be able to receive in return communications from the lawyer reflecting those facts The third assumption supporting the privilege is controversial—that clients would be unwilling to disclose personal, embarrassing, or unpleasant facts unless they could be assured that neither they nor their lawyers could be called later to testify to the communication.¹²

Not surprisingly, egotistical lawyers often think that the attorney-client privilege primarily protects what they tell their clients, rather than vice versa. This is wrong. The most scrupulously protected communications involve clients relating facts to their lawyers so the lawyers can provide advice to the clients. Some courts clearly understand this. For instance, as explained in Chapter 6 of this book, the United States Supreme Court's well-known *Upjohn* case¹³ explains that the then-widely used "control group" theory of privilege in the corporate context erroneously focused on the level of the corporate employee who acted on a lawyer's advice. The Supreme Court instead emphasized the protection for the corporation's relaying of facts to the lawyer, thus extending privilege protection to communications from any

¹⁰ *In re Grand Jury Subpoena*, 662 F.3d 65, 70-71 (1st Cir. 2011).

¹¹ *In re XL Specialty Ins. Co.*, 373 S.W.3d 46, 49 (Tex. 2012) ("[T]he attorney-client privilege promotes free discourse between attorney and client, which advances the effective administration of justice."); *Goldstein v. Colborne Acquisition Co., LLC*, Case No. 10 C 6861, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 75743, at *6 (N.D. Ill. June 1, 2012) ("That purpose is to foster free and open communication between a party and his lawyer regarding legal advice."); *Tex. v. United States*, 279 F.R.D. 24, 27-28 (D.D.C. Jan. 2, 2012), *vacated in part on other grounds*, 270 F.R.D. 176 (D.D.C. Jan. 6, 2012); *Jicarilla Apache Nation*, 131 S. Ct. 2313.

¹² *Restatement (Third) of Law Governing Lawyers* § 68 cmt. c (2000).

¹³ *Upjohn Co. v. United States*, 449 U.S. 383 (1981).

level of corporate employee possessing those facts. This dramatic switch in the corporate attorney-client privilege protection reflected the proper recognition that the privilege primarily protects client-to-lawyer communications rather than lawyer-to-client communications. In fact, as explained in Chapter 17 of this book, the privilege usually does not protect the latter type of communication, unless it reflects what the client told the lawyer in confidence.

Unfortunately, some courts do not seem to understand this critical principle. As explained in Chapter 16 of this book, some courts inexplicably fail to protect the factual portion of clients' communications to their lawyers. To be sure, the privilege never protects historical facts. The traffic light was either red or green, the client either transferred money out of an account or did not, etc. However, it is far different to deny protection for the client's communications relaying those historical facts to the lawyer. By denying protection for such communications, these courts mistakenly strip protection from what should be the most protected of all communications.

2.304 Societal Costs of the Privilege. The attorney-client privilege's societal benefit exacts a cost. The privilege hampers the search for truth by concealing undeniably relevant communications.¹⁴

One court carefully articulated the competing interests that underlie the attorney-client privilege and contribute to the privilege's subtlety and complications.

The purpose of the attorney-client privilege is to facilitate through confidential communications the client's complete disclosure of the circumstances which brought the client to consult with the attorney and the attorney's giving of accurate and useful legal advice. But because the assertion of the privilege can prevent the discovery of information relevant to Court proceedings, the privilege is strictly construed and has limited application only as necessary to maintain its purpose.¹⁵

Courts recognizing the benefits of the attorney-client privilege sometimes acknowledge the cost but apply the privilege nevertheless. For instance, one court conceded a litigant's point that "suppressing [a governmental] report threatens to suppress the truth" but held that the privilege still applied.¹⁶ That court noted that the governmental report at issue was "an honest evaluation" of the government's case and held that "such forthright analysis is necessary" for the government to do its job.¹⁷

¹⁴ *Dewitt v. Walgreen Co.*, Case No. 1:11-cv-00263-BLW, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 125493, at *6 (D. Idaho Sept. 4, 2012) ("[T]he privilege impedes the truth-finding process and must be strictly construed."); *Cont'l. Cas. Co. v. Am. Home Assurance Co.*, Civ. A. No. 2:00-0260, 2010 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 15717, at *6 (S.D. W. Va. Feb. 23, 2010).

¹⁵ *Hanson v. First Nat'l Bank*, Civ. A. No. 5:10-0906, 2011 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 125935 (S.D.W. Va. Oct. 31, 2011).

¹⁶ *United States v. Mallinckrodt, Inc.*, 227 F.R.D. 295, 299 (E.D. Mo. 2005).

¹⁷ *Id.*

2.305 Tension Between Competing Societal Interests. The tension “between the policy of protecting confidential client communications and the policy of requiring every person to give relevant testimony and other evidence when called upon to do so in an official proceeding”¹⁸ affects courts’ analysis of attorney-client privilege issues.

Courts universally apply the privilege narrowly.¹⁹ The privilege is also difficult to create and easy to lose. One court recognized that “[t]he attorney-client privilege is paradoxical, however, in that its robustness is matched by its fragility.”²⁰

Courts’ hostility to the attorney-client privilege can also be seen in judicial comments peppered through privilege decisions. Examples include:

- The privilege is the exception rather than the rule;²¹
- The privilege is not favored.²²

2.306 Benefits of Certainty. For obvious reasons, the privilege cannot fully provide the societal benefits mentioned above if the participants (especially clients) cannot be certain of its application. As the Supreme Court explained,

[I]f the purpose of the attorney-client privilege is to be served, the attorney and client must be able to predict with some degree of certainty whether particular discussions will be protected. An uncertain privilege, or one which purports to be certain but results in widely varying applications by the courts, is little better than no privilege at all.²³

The Supreme Court articulated the same principle in 2011.²⁴

This principle has appeared in other cases. For instance, the Sixth Circuit recognized that “[i]f we intend to serve the interests of justice by encouraging consultation with counsel free from the apprehension of disclosure, then courts must work to delineate the scope of the privilege in ways that are predictable and certain.”²⁵

¹⁸ *Restatement (Third) of Law Governing Lawyers*, Scope, ch.5, Topic 2, tit. A, introductory note (2000).

¹⁹ Chapter 57 of this book discusses that issue.

²⁰ *United States v. Boender*, No. 09 CR 186-1, 2010 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 20670, at *7 (N.D. Ill. Mar. 8, 2010).

²¹ *Sharp v. Trans Union L.L.C.*, 845 N.E.2d 719, 726 (Ill. App. Ct. 2006).

²² *AVX Corp. v. Horry Land Co.*, Civ. A. No. 4:07-cv-3299-TLW-TER, 2010 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 125169, at *15 (D.S.C. Nov. 24, 2010); *Chase v. City of Portsmouth*, 236 F.R.D. 263, 267 (E.D. Va. 2006).

²³ *Upjohn Co. v. United States*, 449 U.S. 383, 393 (1981).

²⁴ *United States v. Jicarilla Apache Nation*, 131 S. Ct. 2313, 2328 (2011) (“We have said that for the attorney-client privilege to be effective, it must be predictable.”).

²⁵ *FTC v. Boehringer Ingelheim Pharms., Inc.*, 286 F.R.D. 101, 108 (D.D.C. 2012) (“Documents that are protected by the attorney-client privilege are thus absolutely privileged as is opinion work product.”); *In re Lott*, 424 F.3d 446, 450 (6th Cir. 2005).